

*Thursday afternoon, 4 November*

**MUSIC AND JEWISH IDENTITY**

**Michael Marissen, Swarthmore College, Chair**

**“FOR YOU HAVE BEEN REBELLIOUS AGAINST THE LORD”:  
THE JEWISH IMAGE IN MENDELSSOHN’S *MOSES* AND MARX’S *MOSE***

Jeffrey S. Sposato  
Brandeis University

In 1832, Adolf Bernhard Marx asked his longtime friend Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy to provide him with a libretto for an oratorio on the subject of Moses. This project, upon its completion, was to lead to the destruction of their friendship. For Marx, this falling out stemmed from the libretto Mendelssohn provided (*Moses*), which was written in a narrative style (similar to Bach’s *Matthäus-Passion*), rather than in one centered around “living realism” (*lebendiger Wahrhaftigkeit*), as Marx had hoped. That Mendelssohn would use such an archaic form led Marx to realize “how far our separate ways had drifted from one another,” and forced him, according to his memoirs, to reject the libretto.

Despite this alleged rejection, however, Marx’s final product—the oratorio *Mose*—still relied heavily on Mendelssohn’s text. Furthermore, an examination of the draft materials Marx provided Mendelssohn at the time of his original request reveals that Marx himself had established the “unacceptable” narrative model that Mendelssohn followed. The true explanation for Marx’s dissatisfaction must therefore lie elsewhere. A comparison of Mendelssohn’s libretto and Marx’s setting provides one explanation: the differing attitudes of these two converted Jews towards their Jewish heritage. Whereas Mendelssohn, whose father strongly encouraged him to distance himself from Judaism, did not shrink from depicting the Jews in a manner which resonated with contemporary anti-Jewish stereotypes, Marx, who converted against his father’s wishes, depicted the Jews in a heroic light, often by making subtle alterations to Mendelssohn’s own text.

**“POLEMIK IM KONZERTSAAL”:  
MAHLER, BEETHOVEN, AND THE VIENNESE CRITICS**

K. M. Knittel  
Seton Hall University

The “polemic” that Richard Heuberger described—in an article for the *Neue freie Presse*—was the controversy surrounding Mahler’s orchestral retouchings of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony, heard in Vienna on 18 and 22 February 1900. Biographers have identified these concerts as the beginning of the crusade against Mahler by Viennese critics that eventually led to his departure from Vienna in 1907. While most writers had been polite (even enthusiastic) prior to the performances of the Ninth, all pretense to civility disappeared immediately afterwards. What this suggests, in light of the fact that Wagner’s own revisions (of 1873) were often performed, is that the critics’ problems were not with the Beethoven revisions per se but with Mahler.

The overwhelming critical condemnation is remarkable not just in its severity but in its attempt to draw cultural boundaries: Mahler, as a Jew, was not perceived as having the “right” to “improve” Beethoven. While not overtly anti-Semitic, the criticisms nevertheless resemble those found in Wagner’s essay *Judentum in der Musik*, where he outlines the Jewish composer’s handicaps: an emphasis on detail to the detriment of the whole, the prevalence of intellect over feeling, and the experience of culture only as “learned” but never as a “mother tongue.” An examination of the critical reactions to these and other Beethoven revisions (by Wagner among others) will illuminate the role that music played in defining “Germanness” and highlight the ways in which anxiety about Mahler’s Jewishness may underlie this critical turning point.

### STRAUSS, *SALOME*, AND THE “JEWISH QUESTION”

Anne L. Seshadri

University of California, San Diego

I examine Richard Strauss’ *Salome* in its musical and socio-historical contexts, and attempt to reconstruct a set of cultural conceptions about Jewishness and difference that existed in fin-de-siècle Germany. I argue that contemporary audiences saw and heard the premiere of Strauss’ *Salome* as a *Judenoper*, which served to reinforce anti-Semitic prejudices. Furthermore, I interpret Strauss’ *Salome* within the context of the “Jewish Question.”

In *Salome*, Strauss set up a dichotomy between the ancient Jewish and Christian worlds that reflected the contemporary political environment. For the early audiences, Herod and his court represented the “foul milieu of an internally decayed, moribund Oriental [read: Jewish] culture,” which served as a sign for the corruption of the modern bourgeois world. Jochanaan embodied the ideals of Christianity and, within the broader context, signified the “traditional consciousness” of German society. Salome, placed between these two spheres, portrayed the plight of the Jews at the turn of the century and served as a metaphor for the “Jewish Question.” Once Salome kissed Jochanaan, she, through Strauss’ music, was transfigured. Salome’s transfiguration metaphorically represented two divergent answers to the “Jewish Question.” In both interpretations, Salome served as a signifier for the destruction of Jewish difference.

By placing Strauss’ opera in its socio-historical context, I move beyond more traditional analyses of Strauss’ opera and current feminist interpretations of Salome. As a significant document in the history of Jewishness and difference, Strauss’ *Salome* is crucial to the understanding of the aesthetic, social, and political structures of the twentieth century.

### ERNEST BLOCH AND THE MUSICAL IMAGE OF JEWISHNESS: FROM “JEZEBEL” TO *SCHELOMO*

Klára Móricz

University of California, Berkeley

For most of his career, Ernest Bloch exemplified the quintessentially Jewish composer. Bloch, however, did not start his career with this goal. Disappointed in the reception of his opera *Macbeth* and torn between what he considered opposing French and German musical aesthetics, Bloch turned to Jewish topics under the influence of two friends: the Zionist Edmond Fleg and the anti-Semite Robert Godet, the latter the translator of H. S. Chamberlain’s

infamous *The Foundations of the Nineteenth Century*. Under Godet's influence, Bloch's Jewish identity was heavily marked by anti-Semitic assumptions.

In his projected opera "Jezebel," the work in which Bloch first expressed his Jewish aspirations, he depicted the imaginary pure world of the Jews with diatonic, simple melodies, while he painted the pagan Jezebel with the lush chromaticism associated with oriental sensuality. "Jezebel" remained unfinished because of Bloch's emigration to the United States (sketches survive in the Library of Congress), and the revolutionary representation of the Jews in "Jezebel" was soon superseded by the reestablishment of a chromatic, augmented-second-ridden style as Jewish music in Bloch's oeuvre. The handful of instrumental works on which his fame as a Jewish composer was based, most famous among them *Schelomo* (1916), fulfill the expectation of Bloch's audience: they play into stereotypes of Jewish music long used by anti-Semitic music critics to condemn Jewish composers. Thus the anti-Semitism that drove Bloch to find a particularly Jewish voice also inspired the corroboration of a musical style that, like the society around them, marked Jews as others.

### LUCA MARENZIO: 1599–1999

James Haar, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, Chair

#### MARENZIO'S MADRIGALS 1610–1929: A RECEPTION HISTORY

Laura Macy

New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians

Where do composers go between their death and their "discovery" by modern musicologists? There is an impression that they languish on library shelves waiting patiently (or not) for their glorious second life. Not so Luca Marenzio.

Enormously popular in his own lifetime, Marenzio's madrigals never completely ceased to be published, copied and performed throughout the succeeding centuries up to their modern "discovery," marked by Einstein's edition of the first six books for five voices in 1929.

The story of Marenzio's madrigals during these three intervening centuries is the subject of this paper. Rather than a single set of works that appear consistently, I have found a series of groups of works in which different aspects of Marenzio's style were found to be adaptable to the musical and aesthetic needs of particular times and places: 17th-century sacred and instrumental repertoires, 18th-century English glee clubs and concert life, and the pioneering musicological studies of the late-18th and early-19th centuries. The historical process of selection and re-selection eventually resulted in a Marenzian "canon" that continues to inform — and misinform — the study of his music.

#### MARENZIO IN FLORENCE

Steven Ledbetter

Newton, Massachusetts

Following the death of Cardinal Luigi d'Este in 1586, the career of Luca Marenzio, the cardinal's most famous musician, becomes difficult to trace in detail. It is well known that Marenzio was one of the participants in the famous 1589 Florentine Intermedi and that he composed the music for two of the six sections of that musico-theatrical spectacle, the most

elaborate part of the entertainment mounted for the wedding of the Grand Duke Ferdinand de' Medici with Christine of Lorraine. But little else has been known about Marenzio's connection with LORENCE hitherto.

During the period of preparation for the famous wedding, the Ferrarese ambassador in Florence wrote twice weekly to his music-loving prince. In addition to the usual political news and speculation, his reports often contained extensive accounts of plans for the festivities, sometimes reporting conversations with Bardi and other participants, many of whom were to become famous a decade later for their involvement in the creation of the first operas.

A study of this material fills out our picture of Marenzio's connection with the Florentine court—including also relatives such as Virginio Orsini, Count of Bracciano—and the musicians known as the Florentine Camerata, with whom he sang in the Intermedi. It helps to clarify, even as it opens new questions about, continuing Medici connections in the final Roman period that followed Marenzio's Florentine interlude.

## MARENZIO AND THE MYTH OF ARCADIA

Giuseppe Gerbino

Duke University

This paper is concerned with Luca Marenzio's role in the construction of the pastoral imagery that dominated secular music of the last two decades of the 16th century. Ever since Alfred Einstein's classic study of the madrigal, Marenzio has been regarded as "the musician of pastoral, of the pastoral in every sense." Einstein also hinted at a possible genealogy of musical pastoral that credited Andrea Gabrieli with the creation of the bucolic spirit in music, a style characterized by a sensuous, lighthearted, canzonetta-like expression. But despite the dimensions and the impact of pastoralism on late-Renaissance music, many aspects of this phenomenon remain somewhat obscure, not least its origin and dissemination. It is curious, in fact, that the seeds of musical pastoralism sown by Gabrieli in Venice sprouted in the Rome of Marenzio. Re-addressing Einstein's proposal, I will seek to demonstrate that Marenzio's pastoral madrigal originated in a social and literary context significantly different from that in which Gabrieli found himself working. Such differences, evident in the textual choices of the two composers, stimulated rather independent stylistic responses, which shed new light on the significance of the late 16TH-century musical infatuation for pastoral poetry.

Discussion will focus on Marenzio's musical settings from Jacobo Sannazar's *Arcadia*. The musical revival of this late quattrocento text, fountainhead of much Renaissance pastoral poetry, seems to be connected with the "rediscovery" of certain formal traits typical of the humanistic eclogue. I will seek to demonstrate, in particular, that the renewed interest in the *sdrucchiolo* lines—traditionally banned from the Petrarchan canon—may be read as a case of interaction between courtly and popular traditions. On the basis of further documentary evidence, I will also argue that the context of Roman patronage is a central issue in the history of the pastoral madrigal of the late-16th century.

MARENZIO, TASSO, AND THE FERRARESE  
*SECONDA PRATICA*, CA. 1575–99

Anthony Newcomb  
 University of California, Berkeley

This paper will start with an interpretation of the well-known passage from Tasso's dialogue *La Cavaletta* (ca. 1585) calling on Luzzaschi, Wert, and Striggio to bring renewed seriousness to the madrigal of the early 1580s. The thrust of this will be to propose why Tasso might have picked the three figures he did, and why Marenzio would logically not have been included, in spite of what has often been written by modern authors. In the process, I will isolate three broadly different aesthetic—or, if you prefer, generic—camps in the madrigal composition of the last quarter of the century and propose that, in this broad sense, the Romans and the Ferrarese belong in the same camp.

In an attempt to clarify and refine my view of the stylistic relationship between the important group of Roman madrigalists, of which Marenzio was the most significant, and the group of madrigalists associated with the Ferrarese court, I will then look particularly at the madrigals of the Ferrarese Alfonso Fontanelli published in his first Book of 1595. I will propose that his setting of Petrarch's *Io piango ed ella il volto*, a highly unusual text for him to choose, is modeled closely on Marenzio's of 1581 and illuminates the differences between the two schools. I will go on to make a similar point with Fontanelli's setting of *Morir non puo il mio core*, which is a fond commentary on the extremely popular setting of the early 1570s by Giovanni Maria Nanino, an important figure and fine composer who should be recognized as the *caposcuola* of the Roman school.

Since Luzzaschi also set *Morir non puo il mio core* in his Third Book of 1582, this text (the only one set by both Luzzaschi and Fontanelli) also allows me to throw some light on the relationship between Fontanelli and Luzzaschi, who was his avowed mentor and the *caposcuola* of the group of composers associated with the Ferrarese court, and between Luzzaschi and the Romans.

**FILM MUSIC**

**Susan McClary, University of California, Los Angeles, Chair**

THE CASE OF HANNS EISLER'S FIRST HOLLYWOOD FILM

Sally Bick  
 Yale University

By the time Hanns Eisler arrived in Hollywood (1942) he was an experienced film composer and a critic of film music. His first film for Hollywood, *Hangmen Also Die* (1942), written for Fritz Lang, was an anti-Nazi propaganda picture based on the 1942 assassination of Reinhard Heydrich, Hitler's *Reichsprotektor* for Czechoslovakia. The music, unlike his other scores, predominantly fits the Hollywood post-romantic conventional style. For Eisler, this was remarkable in light of his theoretical work *Composing for the films*.

Eisler had transformed several of his previous film compositions into chamber works; nevertheless, he made no conscious effort to reuse the materials from *Hangmen*. A passage, however, ironically reappeared in a most conspicuous place: as the opening phrase for the

national anthem of the DDR. That this music should appear first within the context of an anti fascist commercial film for Hollywood and then as a symbol for Marxist ideology provides an incredible irony in light of cold war political ideology. To complicate matters, when the national anthem first appeared in 1950, Eisler was charged in the international courts with plagiarism by West German popular songwriter Peter Kreuder. Kreuder believed Eisler had stolen the opening measures of the anthem from his popular tune "Goodbye Johnny," sung by Hans Albers in the 1939 film *Wasser für Canitoga*. In light of these issues, the paper will untangle this web of associations and contradictions and examine *Hangmen Also Die*, Eisler's first Hollywood film.

MUSICAL ALLUSION IN FILM:  
TRUFFAUT'S REUSE OF JAUBERT'S FILM SCORES

Mark Brill  
University of California, Davis

The great 1930s French film composer, Maurice Jaubert, was among the first to consider film music as a new medium of expression, beyond mere decoration. The composer, who died during World War II, wrote over forty film scores and saw film as an opportunity to develop a popular style that went beyond the classical influences advanced by his colleagues.

Beginning in 1975, François Truffaut used Jaubert's music in his next four films, including *L'histoire D'Adele H*. Truffaut recorded the music from such classics as *L'Atalante* (1934) before shooting began. His film was constructed around Jaubert's music, which guided the cinematic and emotional storyline. Moreover, the music was played during filming, regulating the rhythm of each scene to the music, rather than the reverse. The music is thus both dramatic and organic, serving as a blueprint for the film.

Truffaut's exercise was daring; he risked accusations of pillaging works considered sacrosanct in French film. Yet he viewed it as an homage to Marcel Carne and Jean Vigo, his strongest influences, and for whom Jaubert had composed his greatest scores. Truffaut sought a musical language that represented a specific era of filmmaking, one which contemporary modes of composition had surpassed. By evoking poetic realism, which had deeply affected the young Truffaut, Jaubert's music successfully recreated a past appropriate to the film's story line.

Already literary in nature—Adele is about Victor Hugo's daughter—Truffaut's films allude to masterpieces of French film thematically and visually. Jaubert's music adds yet another layer of understanding. By relying on these allusions, Truffaut makes his characters and ideas continuous, and thus timeless. film, for Truffaut, is more real than reality.

GODARD'S *CARMEN* AND BEETHOVEN'S CINEMATIC FATE

Christopher Reynolds  
University of California, Davis

first in his account of middle-class prostitution in Paris, *Deux ou trois choses que je sais d'elle* (1966) and later in *Prénom Carmen* (1984), Jean-Luc Godard has found in Beethoven's late quartets a musical imagery that accords well with feminist readings of sexual aggression. In this discussion of *Prénom Carmen* I will argue that:

1) contemporary associations of Beethoven and violence in film continue a tradition that has existed since Beethoven was first used as an accompaniment to silent movies;

2) film, with its opera-like dependence on music to convey, create, or comment on aspects of the drama, is the most active heir to a metaphorical mode of expression and hearing that once linked composition and criticism; and

3) the political backgrounds of Godard and the writers I discuss (Mann, Kundera, and Marcuse) influence the impulses to find meaning in Beethoven's music and also the nature of that meaning. From the political left, Beethoven is either an apt expression of chaos or of beauty recognized in the disorder of the real world; from the right, he is a means out of chaos to order. These views thus give new life to long-standing critical reactions to Beethoven's late quartets: chaos or order are in the ears of the beholders.

Unsettling uses of Beethoven evident in films of the past generation draw power from Beethoven's "pathos of humanity" (Adorno) even as they rescue iconic works such as the late quartets from merely celebrating the status quo.

**SUBLIMINAL SOUNDS....?: FILM MUSIC  
AND THE QUESTION OF ATTENTION**

Giorgio Biancorosso  
Princeton University

As those acquainted with the literature on film music would readily agree, the so-called "inaudibility" of film music has been so often invoked as to become almost a cliché. This is unfortunate, for the emphasis on the vague notion of "audibility" has significantly hampered our understanding of how film viewers actually respond to film music. This paper confronts this question afresh by redefining our terms of inquiry around the category of "attention." I will propose that the viewer's responses to film music are best characterized as falling in a continuum between acquired inattentiveness and brief, significant moments of heightened awareness. Drawing from the psychology of perception, I will explore analogies between responses to film music and stock examples of perception in everyday life. On the strength of such analogies, I will also revisit another long-standing cliché, namely the idea that film music is most effective when "unheard."

**COLONIAL AMERICAS AND COPLAND'S AMERICAS**

**Ralph P. Locke, Eastman School of Music, Chair**

**REVISING THE 'AMERICAN' HISTORICAL NARRATIVE:  
MEXICO CITY'S MUSICAL PRIMACY IN THE AMERICAS  
BEFORE AND AFTER INDEPENDENCE, CA. 1750-1830**

John Koegel  
University of Missouri, Columbia

Though Latin American scholars have long recognized the primacy of Mexico City's musical life in colonial America, North American musicologists have often ignored Spanish America in their studies of American music. However, the historical and musical evidence suggests that both sacred and secular music in Mexico was equal to or even superior to that practiced in the British North American colonies before or soon after Independence. Though Mexican cathedral music (at Mexico City, Puebla, Oaxaca, Durango) has been investigated

by Mexican and North American music historians, relatively little has heretofore been published about secular musical life in Mexico before and after the colonial period (ca. 1750–1830).

New archival documentation and previously unknown musical manuscripts have been discovered in Mexico City (Archivo General de la Nación) and San Francisco (Sutro Library) which reveal significant new information about the impressive range of secular music forms available in Mexico City for elite-, middle-, and working-class people. These include classic-era instrumental forms by Mozart, Haydn, Pleyel and other European and Mexican composers; popular dance, social dance, ballet, and theater music; Italian opera; and Mexican and Spanish genres. This paper demonstrates that the entire range of European and local Mexican secular forms was practiced to a high degree of excellence in Mexico City (probably surpassing New York, Philadelphia, or Boston), and that Mexican musicians kept abreast of the latest musical developments in Madrid, Paris, London, and other European and American cities. This new information also points to the need for a more inclusive historical narrative of American music.

“A VOICE WAS HEARD IN ROXBURY”:  
THE RELIGIOUS, HISTORICAL, AND MUSICAL CONTEXT OF  
BILLINGS’S *LAMENTATION OVER BOSTON*

Charles E. Brewer  
florida State University

One of the most clearly patriotic works that Billings published in his *The Singing Master’s Assistant* was the biblical paraphrase, *Lamentation Over Boston*. This paper examines three significant facets of this work that have not been previously discussed and that can deepen our contemporary understanding of the work.

first, the *Lamentation Over Boston* is related to the jeremiad, a type of political sermon that drew analogies between the situations of Israel and colonial New England. Parallels will be drawn between the anthem and three contemporary works on similar texts: Moses Mathers tract, *America’s Appeal to the Impartial World*, written after December 1773, the thanksgiving sermon of Samuel Williams from 15 December 1774, and the election sermon Samuel Langdon preached in Watertown on 31 May 1775.

Secondly, Billings’s allusion to “A voice was heard in Roxbury” probably refers to William Gordon, the radical preacher of the Third Church in Roxbury. This connection is evident in two of Gordon’s published sermons: 15 December 1774 and the election sermon preached in Watertown 19 July 1775. Both of these sermons are jeremiads and reflect Gordon’s commitment to the patriots during the Siege of Boston.

finally, Billings’s *Lamentation Over Boston* is actually a musical imitation of an earlier setting of Psalm 137 by Caleb Ashworth that was frequently printed in pre-revolutionary tunebooks. Similarities in keys and melodic patterns clearly point to Billings’s familiarity with this earlier English anthem.

COPLAND'S MUSIC FOR THE THEATRE,  
FRENCH NEOCLASSICISM, AND THE NEW AMERICAN MUSIC

Gayle Murchison  
Tulane University

Copland's reputation as a nationalist composer rests largely on works such as *Billy the Kid*, *Appalachian Spring*, *Rodeo*—compositions that quote American folk tunes. His mature works that imitate 1920's jazz are also categorized as nationalist. This view, however, is incomplete and overly simplistic. In *Art and Everyday: Popular Entertainment and the Circle of Erik Satie* (1991), Nancy Perloff argues that French composers Milhaud, Poulenc, and Auric, influenced by the music of Erik Satie and the ideas of Cocteau in *Le Coq et l'Harlequin*, modeled their new French music on the Parisian popular entertainments of the circus, fair, café-concert, cabaret, music hall, and merry-go-round.

*Music for the Theatre* (1925) shows how nationalism intersects with international modernism and reveals the pervasive ways in which Copland was influenced by the French neoclassical styles and techniques of Milhaud and Stravinsky, the teachings of Nadia Boulanger, and the aesthetics of Jean Cocteau. This paper argues that the ideas of these French neoclassicists opened Copland to the possibility that African-American jazz, then recognized by Europeans as both a distinctly American music and as a modern music, could be used to create a modern, American music. Thus Copland's use of jazz signifies the French origins of his neoclassical aesthetic and new American style. In *Music for the Theatre* Copland synthesizes harmonic, tonal, and melodic techniques derived from Stravinsky and Milhaud with jazz-derived melodic, timbral, instrumental, and rhythmic techniques to create a music that is primarily modernist and secondarily American.

ARRANGING "GIT ALONG, LITTLE DOGIES":  
A CASE STUDY USING AARON COPLAND'S COWBOY SONGBOOKS

Jessica Burr  
Princeton University

Given Aaron Copland's popular reputation as a composer of "Western" Americana, it is perhaps surprising that his archive at the Library of Congress contains only three volumes devoted to cowboy songs, most likely given to him as sources for the ballet *Billy the Kid*. The publications they contain, however, are in themselves striking for the wide variety of approaches toward their common subject, from the bare transcriptions of John and Alan Lomax to the sprawling piano arrangements of Oscar J. Fox. At a time of broad popular interest in the "Wild West," each collector hoped his or her own approach would capture and maintain public interest, whether in the living room or in the concert hall.

Comparing five arrangements of the well-known "Git Along, Little Dogies," I will show how they reflected the goals of various advocates of the cowboy and his music. To varying degrees, the arrangements (and, in one case, the alternative melody chosen) reflected society's simultaneous domestication and romanticization of the cowboy, which paradoxically created a mythic, larger-than-life outsider who was presentable enough for middle-class mores. The collection most helpful to Copland, compiled by "radio cowboy" John White, occupied a kind of musical middle ground between unadorned documentation (as in the Lomax book of

1938) and the Wild West of popular fantasy. This allowed the composer to put a personal stamp on certain conventions without having to strip away more romantic interpretations.

### OPERA AND POLITICS

Jane F. Fulcher, Indiana University, Chair

#### EMULATION, ALLEGORY, AND LONDON'S ARIADNES (1734): THE PROBLEM OF POLITICS IN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY OPERA

Suzanne Aspden

Robinson College, Cambridge University

Historians have long unquestioningly espoused John Lord Hervey's famous suggestion that the 1730s rivalry between Handel and the "Opera of the Nobility" was politically biased, with the Prince of Wales and the "Patriot" Opposition backing the Nobility, and King George II and his Queen behind Handel. Current consensus among Handelians, however, adduces financial and political evidence to give the lie to Hervey; yet a mass of contemporary reportage describing the opera in broadly political terms remains unexplained.

This paper proposes a reconciliation of modern findings and Hervey's account through close examination of Hervey's narrative and of the social and political events of 1733–34 that formed a background to the performance of the first two truly "rival" operas, Handel's *Arianna in Creta* and Rolli's and Porpora's *Arianna in Naxos*. Showing for the first time how these works may have contributed to debate surrounding the 1734 marriage of Anne, Princess Royal of Britain and William IV, Prince of Orange, I argue that political allegory and emulation of society as well as each other played a part in the companies' rivalry. More generally, this paper will suggest that we can broaden our understanding of the meaning of early 18th-century opera by viewing these allegorical works as emulative acts, functioning socially and artistically as simultaneously creative and imitative. Understanding emulation's importance allows us to see the politicization of opera at this time not simply as a game of allegory, but also as a matter of cultural analogy, one positing opera as a nexus for social and aesthetic change.

#### "L'AFFAIRE DE CHARLES VI, OU LA CAUSE MINISTÉRIELLE" AT THE PARIS OPÉRA, 1843

Diana R. Hallman

University of Kentucky

This paper explores the political controversy surrounding the premiere of Halévy's grand opera *Charles VI* at the Paris Opéra on 15 March 1843. Based somewhat on the tragedy *La Démence de Charles VI* (1826), the opera depicts the 15th-century French-English alliance between Isabelle de Bavière and Henry IV and their power struggles with the mentally unstable Charles VI and his son. Its militaristic tone and blatant presentation of the British as enemies—coming only three years after France had moved to the brink of war with England over Egypt's seizure of Syria—alarmed the foreign minister François Guizot. Concerned that the opera would re-incite anti-British fervor, Guizot called for textual alterations and threatened to ban the work almost on the eve of its premiere. The ministerial intrusions brought a

flurry of journalistic commentary, with many writers treating the opera's appearance as a matter of state.

This "affair" further demonstrates the contemporary belief in the power of grand opera to shape public views and stir emotions, while it adds new insights into the capricious relationship between the Paris Opéra and the government of the July Monarchy, as well as journalistic trends in the reception of controversial theater pieces. Drawing from libretto and music sources, Opéra correspondence, and press accounts, I will examine the work's political context, varying censorial and ministerial demands and their effects on the 1843 *Charles VI*, and conflicting responses of the Parisian public.

## THE CONFRONTATION OF VERISMO AND THE GILDED AGE

JoAnn Taricani

University of Washington

The rejection of Puccini's *La Bohème* after its New York premiere in 1898 sharply delineates the elitist oligarchy of opera in Gilded Age society. Unlike his later operas that arrived via the Metropolitan Opera organization, his earliest operas entered New York through the back door of the West Coast in 1897–98.

That Puccini's operas had first been heard in West Coast cities, in performances by a professional Italian troupe sponsored by Ricordi, diminished and marginalized their significance on the East Coast, where the tour concluded. A combination of elitism and racism soured the initial reception of Puccini in New York, aided by the unfortunate choice of a music hall as venue, and the introduction of "popular" prices. *La Bohème* was tainted for years by its perceived association with Floradora chorus girls and native Italians—but these perceptions were fostered by vested interests.

My reconstruction of the 5,000-mile premiere tour and triumphant reception of Puccini's operas throughout the rest of the United States, viewed alongside New York court documents, letters, and memoirs, clearly shows that manipulation by New York's operatic establishment doomed the Ricordi-licensed Italian company. The agents of the revived reputation of *La Bohème* at the Metropolitan Opera were the same agents of its initial rejection in New York. A complex web including Nellie Melba, the critic Henry Krehbiel, and a New York publisher shrouded Puccini's works, using various lower-class and racist signifiers to suppress the operas until Melba and the Metropolitan could receive permission from Ricordi to mount and "rehabilitate" the works.

*Thursday evening, 4 November*

**PANEL DISCUSSION**

**DEFINING A NATION:  
POLISH COMMUNITIES AND SYMBOLS IN MUSIC**

**Maria Anna Harley, University of Southern California, Chair**

**Michael Beckerman, University of California, Santa Barbara**

**Halina Goldberg, Indiana University**

**Bret Werb, Holocaust Memorial Museum**

**Timothy Cooley, University of California, Santa Barbara**

**Hankus Netsky, New England Conservatory of Music**

**Margarita Mazo, Ohio State University, Session Respondent**

This interdisciplinary panel develops certain ideas about constructs of nationhood that arose during the International Conference “Polish/Jewish Music!” held in November 1998 at the University of Southern California. One of the goals of the conference was to demonstrate that one cannot write a history of Polish music without recognizing the role of musicians and composers of Jewish descent. A Polish-Canadian historian, Prof. Piotr Wrobel, stated at the conference that “it is impossible to eliminate Poland from the history of the Jews and to remove the Jews from the history of Poland.” Nonetheless, the contribution of Polish Jewry to music has not been fully acknowledged and the issue of Polish anti-Semitism continues to attract scholarly attention (e.g. conference at Loyola Marymount University, Los Angeles, January 1999).

The panel discussion will focus on the process of defining Polish national identity in music during the 19th and 20th centuries, a process that included controversies about the cultural belonging of Polish Jewry, the shifting focus on folklore from different areas of Poland, and the struggle between religious and secular concepts of the nation reflected in the choice of the national anthem. In the latter category, the main contenders included the religious “God, Save Poland” and the secular “Dabrowski Mazurka” that became the official anthem in 1926 (thanks to the efforts of Poland’s philo-Semitic leader, Pilsudski). However, the continuous use of the 13th-century Marian hymn “Bodgurodzica” as a symbol of Poland’s ancient nationhood indicates the survival of the non-inclusive, religious definition of Polish national identity (Polish=Catholic) in contemporary music and musical culture. These symbolic and communal aspects of national anthems will be discussed by Harley (“Polish Anthems, ‘Bogurodzica’ and Poland’s Millennium”). Her presentation will be preceded by Beckerman’s thought-provoking statements about the psychosomatic roots of the longing for “national purity” and the pervasiveness of non-inclusive definitions of national identity during the discussed period (“Neuro-Nationalism, or Why Can’t Everyone Just Be Friends?”). While Poland’s national anthem is a mazurka, the folk-music sources of national identification shifted from the music of Mazovia to that of the Tatra Mountains; the issue will be presented by Cooley (“Core Identity of Musical Polishness”).

The changes in cultural belonging of Polish Jewry will be discussed by Halina Goldberg (“Assimilation of Jews into 19th-Century Polish Musical Culture”), who will present the complexity of the Jewish identity in Poland and the musical co-existence of both groups. Bret

Werb will cast light on musical aspects of Polish anti-Semitism (“Mayufes as Window on Polish Jewish Relations”). Hankus Netsky will direct attention to Polish roots of klezmer music and the intersections of personal/national identities that this subject entails (“Klezmorim from Poland”). Finally, Margarita Mazo, a Russian-music specialist and the panel’s respondent, will emphasize similarities and differences of the Polish situation to that of its nemesis, Russia. The panel discussion will take into account recent scholarship, especially Richard Taruskin’s *Defining Russia Musically* (1998).

## STUDY SESSION

### RETHINKING CONCERT PROGRAMS

**William Weber, California State University, Long Beach, Chair**  
**Nancy Newman, Brown University**  
**Jann Pasler, University of California, San Diego**  
**James Deaville, McMaster University**

Music historians have yet to develop a methodology for analysis of concert programs. We usually turn to programs for little more than notices of first performances or famous figures and thereby skate over the surface of a major aspect of musical performance—the patterns by which concerts presented works and performers. We need to start asking basic questions about the practices by which musicians designed programs, the musical and ideological assumptions that lay behind them, and the discourse that went on in their development. One could extend the thinking of Jeffrey Kallberg to say that programs grew out of the contracts made between musicians and their publics, and that they evolved as a process of ongoing negotiation between these parties.

This session will offer a broad perspective upon a little-explored aspect of musical life. The speakers will discuss bodies of programs in four major countries: William Weber on the “miscellaneous concert” in 19th-century Britain; Nancy Newman on the Germania Society in the U.S., 1848–1854; Jann Pasler on popular concerts of classical repertory in Paris 1870–1913; and James Deaville on the Allgemeiner Deutscher Musikverein, 1859–1937.

*Friday morning, 5 November*

**NINETEENTH-CENTURY TOPICS: MUSIC, SOCIETY, IDEOLOGY**

**Jeffrey Kallberg, University of Pennsylvania, Chair**

**ALIENATION AND POWERLESSNESS:**

**ADAM MICKIEWICZ'S *BALLADY* AND CHOPIN'S *BALLADES***

Dorota Zakrzewska

McGill University

In this paper I propose that Chopin's *Ballades* share a common narrative archetype with Mickiewicz's *Ballady*. To mention Chopin and Mickiewicz in the same breath is not new in the literature: since the 19th century, many critics have tried to posit an association between specific Mickiewicz poems and individual *Ballades*. More recently, scholars have tried a different approach: Karol Berger has pointed to the ideological influences of the Polish emigration in Paris on Chopin's *Ballades* (Mickiewicz was certainly an important figure in this expatriate society). James Parakilas has seen the *Ballades* against the generic characteristics of the European literary ballad tradition (of which Mickiewicz's works, of course, are a prominent part).

In the first part of my paper I review the ideology of the Polish emigration in Paris, outlining themes presented by Berger, such as alienation, homelessness, and morbid anxiety, and developing some of my own, such as powerlessness, pilgrimage, and nostalgia. I also trace parallels between Mickiewicz and Chopin: their common experience and beliefs, and certain analogies in their work. Then I analyze parallels between the ideology of the Great Emigration and the ideology manifest in all nine of Mickiewicz's *Ballady*. This thematic and structural analysis of Mickiewicz's *Ballady* as a group provides my narrative model for Chopin's *Ballades*. A particularly strong case can be made for the second *Ballade*: in the last part of the paper I demonstrate how certain generalized textual and thematic features of the poems can be mapped onto the musical discourse of this work.

**THE IDEA OF THE INFINITE: PENTATONICISM AS A RELIGIOUS**

**TOPOS IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY MUSIC**

Jeremy Day O'Connell

Cornell University

This paper introduces a previously unrecognized category of musical signification in the 19th century: the "religious pentatonic." Beyond its well-known associations with the "primitive" and the "exotic" (Mendelssohn "Scottish" Symphony, Debussy "Pagodes"), pentatonicism in 19th-century music also served to convey the idea of spirituality, in the hands of such composers as Liszt, Bruckner, Fauré, and others. I discuss the history of the phenomenon, explain its emergence and acceptance in light of ideological and aesthetic considerations, and examine the mechanics of its signification.

I define pentatonicism as a set of melodic attributes rather than as an exhaustive expression of a particular scale. In Western art music, 19th-century pentatonicism represents a subtle alteration of classical principles of scale-degree function, most notably in the pentatonic "step" between 6 and 8 of the major scale. Indeed, this anomaly conforms to the melodic

style of liturgical chant, a repertoire that enjoyed a marked revival in the 19th century. I examine the theory and rhetoric surrounding the early-century chant revival, which exhibited a pronounced yearning for melodic and scalar “purity” and a distrust of the “modern” developments of chromaticism in general and leading tones in particular. The religious pentatonic, I suggest, may be regarded as a consummation of these views.

I present several musical examples, discussing them in the context of my historical/interpretive model, as well as in theoretical/analytical terms.

“A SONG OF UNION FOR ALL PEOPLE”:  
POPULAR MUSIC EDUCATION AND GERMAN HIGH MUSICAL  
CULTURE IN THE EARLY NINETEENTH CENTURY

David Gramit  
University of Alberta

The title quotation, with which A. B. Marx characterized the choral finale of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony, also encapsulates a widespread aspiration among participants in early-19th-century musical life: universalization of literate musical culture among the population through reformed school music. This phenomenon, largely neglected by musicologists, provides a new perspective on the place of art music in German society, in both the imaginations of its advocates and the far more resistant world of musical and social activity.

Drawing on authors including Marx, Nägeli, and Zelter, and on discussions in contemporary periodicals, I read the discourse of music education as placed ambivalently between reformist ideals and realities such as limited resources and the role of schooling in reproducing a hierarchical society. The ideal of a musical culture accessible to all resonated strongly with the bourgeois ideology of universality, but the means reformers prescribed (singing instruction disciplinary in Foucault’s sense), the goal they sought (literate culture realizing human “nature” by rooting out the crudities of popular culture), and continuing unequal access all ensured that musical culture remained an indicator of prestige in a hierarchical society. Ironically, this “failure” gave educational discourse a doubly practical value for musicians: at a time of heightened insecurity for the profession, both the rhetoric of bourgeois ideology and the association of genuine musical culture not with general education but with an educated elite helped secure the status of musicians as members of the “new” *Bürgertum* rather than remnants of a declining trade dependent on guilds or court service.

MUSICAL PARTICIPATION AND SOCIAL MODELS  
IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY GERMANY

Karen Ahlquist  
George Washington University

After an 1832 visit to the *Caecilienverein* chorus in Frankfurt, Felix Mendelssohn reported that “the women...are the most enthusiastic ones, whereas the men are a bit wanting.” Twenty years later, Mendelssohn’s comment was reflected in membership numbers: in the 1830s and 40s, the balance between male and female membership in most German choral societies was roughly equal. The 1850s, however, brought ratios of two or even three women for every

man, even as bylaws changes in prominent societies were eliminating women's former rights to leadership positions.

This study explores the role of participants and organizational factors in creating meaning within a socio-musical tradition. It argues that the early-19th-century German mixed chorus served as an innovative social and sometimes political model whose complexity was often reflected in the varying textures of contemporaneous choral works. By mid-century, however, its integration into Germany's developing formal concert culture, the latter dominated by music societies often linked with local government, cost the chorus the independence and status it needed to sustain such a model on its own terms.

The change in gender organization after 1850 suggests that the chorus's newly inferior position was understood from within. The decline in status of the chorus and its principal genre, the oratorio, undermined its previously developed social model, virtually eliminated amateur participation as an essential means of handing down the Western art tradition, and narrowed the scope in meaning of the tradition as a whole.

### THE MIDDLE AGES AND BEYOND

Edward C. Nowacki, University of Cincinnati, Chair

#### NEW EVIDENCE OF THE OLD BENEVENTAN CHANT

Thomas Forrest Kelly  
Harvard University

The old Beneventan chant is the music of the liturgy of southern Italy, one of the regional liturgies that once provided Europe with a great diversity of musical styles. This repertory, called "Ambrosian" by its practitioners, was suppressed in the course of the 10th and 11th centuries at the adoption of the Frankish-Roman chant now called Gregorian.

Owing to its physical eradication and destruction, the Beneventan chant must be reconstructed from fragmentary remains. My 1989 book, *The Beneventan Chant*, reported all the surviving sources known at that time. In the ten years intervening, however, new pieces of evidence concerning the old Beneventan chant have come to light, and this paper reports on them.

The new materials are of three kinds. First are references to lost books of old Beneventan chant; these come from library catalogues and other sources, as in this item from 11th-century Bari: "antifonarium de dia et alium de nocte (unum ambrosianum)." Secondly, there are repeated references to the continued practice of an "officium longobardum" as late as the 16th century.

Thirdly, and most important, there are new musical sources. Some of these are new witnesses to Beneventan music that is already known, but three of them contain music hitherto unrecorded: an office for the Epiphany, a mass for St. John the Evangelist, and a mass for the Purification. These sources will be presented, and their importance for the understanding of the scope and extent of this ancient musical practice will be suggested.

ADÉMAR DE CHABANNES, CAROLINGIAN  
MUSICAL PRACTICES, AND *NOTA ROMANA*

James Grier

University of Western Ontario

Writing in 1027–28, Adémar de Chabannes states in his *Historia* that Pope Adrian I in A.D. 787 gave Charlemagne antiphoners equipped with musical notation in the Roman style (*nota romana*), and further that the Frankish cantors learned the notation and now call it Frankish notation. By unequivocally placing musical notation in the 8th-century, this account provides suggestive evidence regarding the long-standing controversy about its origins. Furthermore, Adémar makes an otherwise unattested Roman notation the direct historical precedent for the various notational dialects known by the 10th century in post-Carolingian western Europe. Although his account is more than two centuries removed from the events it purports to narrate, it warrants serious consideration. Adémar was the most accomplished historian of his generation in Aquitaine, and also a fully competent and professional musician, skilled in the latest developments in musical notation, and an able composer. Moreover, the audience for Adémar's *Historia* included his monastic colleagues, some of whom would be at least as knowledgeable in musical matters as the author himself. Therefore, at a minimum, Adémar's statement reflects a version of events that would be found credible by his educated contemporaries. This paper, drawing on the historical, literary and musical context within which Adémar worked, considers three possible interpretations: that he was a victim of Carolingian propaganda about the origin of plainsong; that he was simply extrapolating backwards from the state of his own musical knowledge and literacy; or that he was preserving an otherwise unknown historical tradition.

THE DATE AND ORIGIN OF THE *MUSICA DISCIPLINA*

Barbara Hagg

University of North Texas

Twenty-four years after Gushee's edition of the *Musica disciplina* and thirteen since Bernhard questioned Gushee's date for the treatise of circa 840–850, both date and origin remain disputed. Paleographical and codicological analyses of Valenciennes, Bibliothèque Municipale, MS 148, the earliest source; examination of its text with methods borrowed from diplomatic; and a reappraisal of Oxford, Bodleian Library, MS Canonici Misc. 212, support a new hypothesis.

Prickings for binding unique to the *Musica disciplina* in Valenciennes 148 prove that it circulated as an independent *libellus* before taking its present form ca. 1150 at the abbey of St. Amand, opening the possibility of copying outside the abbey. (The Annunciation office at its end is closest to that in manuscripts from Burgundy.) Paleofrank notation in MS 148 dates the *libellus* from the last third of the ninth century.

A neumed early tenth-century manuscript from St. Jean de Réôme, the only primary source to name Aurelian's dedicatee "Bernardus, bishop of Autun," helps to resolve the "Bernard problem": chapters 1 to 18 and the preface of the treatise date from ca. 856–860. Analysis of the opening distichs and miracles, none discussed in musicological literature on Aurelian, and of texts derived from Isidore of Seville, Boethius and glossators, and Macrobius, provide new evidence that Aurelian was writing in the region of Auxerre, that he added chapters 19

and 20 when he learned of notation, and that the miracles between the explicits of MS 148 date from ca. 880. Canonici 212 does not have readings earlier than MS 148; its exemplar reflects Cluniac reforms and postdates MS 148.

### SOME CHANTS FOR THE MASS PROPER, CA. 1575–1800

Theodore Karp  
Northwestern University

When, in 1577, Pope Gregory VIII commissioned a revision of chant to accompany the newly authorized breviary and missal, the centuries' old tradition of avoiding changes in the transmission of the early corpus of chant suffered a death blow. By 1591 a sharply revised Gradual appeared in Venice, to be followed by numerous others of distinctive natures. Except for information about the Gradual issued in 1614/15 by the Medici Press in Rome, very little is known about these various editorial ventures. By virtue of this lacuna, the *Editio Medicea* has often been taken as representative of all of chant in the period between its date of issue and the mid-19th century. Yet *Editio Medicea* apparently represented nothing more than a local tradition until its promulgation in the mid-19th century. It was neither the earliest of the "reform" Graduals, nor the most drastic in its revisions. This paper will consider a few selected chants of the Mass Proper that illustrate the nature of differences occurring in various major centers of Europe, such as Venice, Antwerp, and Paris. Additional information will be provided concerning chant in Germany and Cistercian chant. A much more vibrant picture of activity in chant emerges, one that has broad implications for the nature of learning and performance.

### RACE AND AMERICAN MUSIC

Marva G. Carter, Georgia State University, Chair

#### "ALL I WANTS IS MA CHICKENS": THE USE OF RACIAL STEREOTYPES BY AFRICAN-AMERICAN LYRICISTS IN POPULAR SONG, 1895–1905

John Graziano  
City College and Graduate Center, City University of New York

The sudden emergence in 1895 of popular songs that combined African-American dialect with ragtime rhythms dramatically changed the course of American vernacular music in the 20th century. These songs, which were generally referred to as "coon" songs, quickly became fashionable with the theater-going public, and were heard in vaudeville as well as in musical theater works.

Seen from today's perspective, the lyrics of these songs, although they were written by both black and white lyricists, offend our sensibilities because they foster a negative racist view of African-Americans and their society. Some commentators have suggested that black lyricists were forced into penning this type of lyric because they had to compete with their white colleagues. A careful study, however, reveals that this thesis is not supported by the publication history of these songs. There are a significant number of coon songs by African-Americans that are among the earliest examples of the genre.

While many coon songs “shouted” by white singers were heard by white audiences, these songs were also performed by black performers for all-black audiences. This paper, which includes examples of selected lyrics and excerpts of early recorded performances, examines the many subjects parodied and ridiculed by black lyricists and offers some possible reasons why blacks participated in writing these songs and why these songs were so popular in the African-American community.

“SWING WEDDING”: THE IMAGE AND SOUND OF JAZZ IN  
CLASSICAL HOLLYWOOD ANIMATION

Daniel Goldmark  
University of California, Los Angeles

This paper examines the role of jazz and swing music in animated shorts of the 1930s and early 1940s, and the contributing role these films had in constructing society’s image of such music. After accounting for the possible reasons, both practical and ideological, for using jazz in these films, I examine the shorts themselves to explain how popular music became essential to the animated medium, looking specifically at the approaches of two studios: the use of live footage of famous musicians in the Fleischer shorts versus parodies by Warner Bros. of their own well-known musical players. I discuss why animated shorts were so receptive to and made such effective use of swing and jazz, especially at a key moment in the developments of both music for animated films and these popular musical genres. Also, I address how these shorts that deal so heavily in black stereotypes show how the black community in the 1930s, and particularly how jazz and jazz musicians, were perceived by the white middle class creating these films. While all animated shorts eventually became musically dependent on the swing style, I will demonstrate that those which invested themselves heavily in the stereotyped images of jazz’s practitioners had other, less noble goals in mind.

“AIN’T GONNA LET NOBODY TURN ME ‘ROUND”:  
MUSIC OF RESISTANCE IN 1960s AMERICA

Nadya Zimmerman  
University of California, Los Angeles

In 1962, Preacher Ralph T. Abernathy taught a spiritual to a crowd gathered for a mass meeting protesting racial discrimination on buses in Albany, Georgia. By introducing spirituals into the collective consciousness of a social movement in the United States, Abernathy participated in long-standing traditions established in the black Baptist church and the folk singing community. Sung at marches, sit-ins and mass meetings, the spirituals instigated, participated in, and reflected the racial, ethical, and philosophical changes in community during the 1960s.

The Civil Rights Movement confirms the notion put forth by musicologists such as Attali and McClary that music and social change are inextricable. But specifically, why were a set of songs dating back to slavery, which envisioned an ideal world of eternal justice, applicable to the Civil Rights Movement? How did the spirituals, as living folk expressions, become adapted and redefined alongside a changing black consciousness and community during the 1960s? In what ways did the negotiation of individual and communal strengths embodied in singing spirituals interact with the Movement’s philosophy of non-violence?

Given that singing traditional songs from African-American history provided a link between protesters and other suffering people that came before them in American history, what impact did this sense of historical continuity have on the Movement? Using musical analysis, cultural criticism, and historical accounts, this paper addresses the above questions to bring us to a greater understanding of the human capacity for racism and violence and the power of music for survival and transcendence.

"THE AMERICAN DREAM":  
MISS SAIGON AND THE POLITICS OF MEMORY

Ellie M. Hisama

Brooklyn College and Graduate Center, City University of New York

When Claude-Michel Schoenberg and Alain Boublil's musical *Miss Saigon* was first brought to Broadway from its successful London run, it was greeted by protests from some of the Asian- and African-American members of the Actors Equity Association for its decision to cast the character of a Eurasian pimp with the white British actor Jonathan Pryce. After producer Cameron Mackintosh threatened to cancel the musical's New York run altogether, Actors Equity decided to permit the original casting rather than to forego numerous employment opportunities for its members.

Using the 1990 controversy over Mackintosh's controversial casting as a starting point, this paper discusses the racial and sexual politics of *Miss Saigon* in order to present a critical reading of the musical as an attempt to whitewash and sentimentalize the tragedy of United States involvement in the Vietnam War. The analytical portion of the paper focuses on the musical numbers "The Heat Is On In Saigon," "I'd Give My Life For You," and "The American Dream." I argue that the score's uninformed inclusion of Asian music contributes to the musical's overriding message that blurring distinctions among Asian peoples is a sufficient and acceptable practice. Like its predecessors *Madama Butterfly* and *South Pacific*, *Miss Saigon* effectively demonstrates that a crucial cultural way for a society to leave behind an uncomfortable history of military intervention and colonialism is through the medium of musical theater.

**TWENTIETH-CENTURY INTERFACES**  
**Elliott Antokoletz, University of Texas, Austin, Chair**

RAVEL'S "RUSSIAN" PERIOD:  
OCTATONICISM IN HIS EARLY WORKS (1893–1908)

Steven Baur  
University of California, Los Angeles

The most consequential writings concerning the appearance and application of the octatonic scale in Western music have taken as their starting point the music of Igor Stravinsky. Richard Taruskin convincingly traces the origins of the scale to the mediant harmonic progressions used frequently by Schubert and Liszt and reveals the extent to which it pervades Russian chromatic harmony from the latter half of the 19th century, particularly that of Nikolai Rimsky-Korsakov, Stravinsky's teacher from 1905 to 1908. Others have examined

appearances of the octatonic scale outside of Russia, with several French sources garnering most of the attention. Yet there has been little effort dedicated to a critical comparison of French and Russian examples of octatonic writing, and none of the literature on French octatonicism is significantly informed by the wealth of scholarship on the Russian octatonic tradition—this, in spite of the fact that we have long known of the profound interest in Russian music cultivated among Parisian circles as early as the 1870s. The existing literature on French octatonicism deals primarily with the music of Claude Debussy (and later that of Olivier Messiaen), but octatonicism also figures prominently in the music of Maurice Ravel in ways that warrant a closer look. Several works composed during the first 15 years of his career implicate Ravel directly in the octatonic legacy, simultaneously bearing the influence of 19th-century chromatic harmony as practiced by Liszt and Rimsky-Korsakov and antipating methods of octatonic partitioning heretofore considered unique to Stravinsky.

### BARTÓK'S 1907 VIOLIN CONCERTO: IN THE "SPIRIT OF TRISTAN"

Alicja I. Usarek

The University of Texas, Austin

The genesis of Béla Bartók's 1907 Violin Concerto is intimately linked to his love for the young violin virtuoso, Stefi Geyer. Since it was not the young composer's wont to share the joys and sorrows of his life, even with the woman he loved, he consorted through his music: the late-romantic idiom of Strauss and especially of Wagner's *Tristan* is of the essence in his compositional expression. Playing *Tristan* to her *Isolde*, Bartók expressed his feelings by sounding various allusions to Wagner's paean to unrequited love. Biography and allusions to *Tristan* thus supply important keys for understanding the message in "Stefi's concerto." But Bartók also draws upon authentic sources, which give voice to the humble truths of peasants.

This paper will show how the Concerto plays a dual role at this musical crossroads of Bartók's development, inserting him into two worlds: the ideal world of Stefi and the real world of the peasant. It is the spirit of *Tristan*—and yet, as manifested in the concrete musical details of the Concerto score, more than just this spirit—which bridges the gap between both worlds. This polarity, linked by the first hint of the *Tristan* "grief-motif" (A-F-E), is projected into the contrasting thematic ideas of the first and second movements. The *Tristan* leitmotif thus plays a second role as catalyst, in taking us from the pole of the ideal, romantic world to that of the pentatonic/modal world of the peasant.

Bartók's correspondence to Stefi Geyer (private collection of the Paul Sacher Stiftung in Basel) consists of twenty letters, six postcards, diary notes, and the manuscript of the Concerto (a posthumous work). His letters of 26 and 29 November 1907 provide the one and only revelation of the meaning of another leitmotif, the major-seventh chord (D-F#-A-C#), which the composer designed as the "love-motif" for Stefi. Both the Stefi-*Isolde* "love-motif" and the Béla-*Tristan* "grief-motif" are conveyed through the music in an organic process involving numerous metamorphoses and characterizations.

### SHOSTAKOVICH AND WOZZECK'S SECRET

David Haas  
University of Georgia

Four years before *Pravda's* 1936 publication of "Muddle Instead of Music," Shostakovich had initiated a change in his compositional style marked by an abandonment of atonal experimentation and a reappearance of tonally-centered, lyrical, scalar melody, perfect authentic cadences, and key signatures. Since this partial rapprochement with common-practice tonality predates the *Lady Macbeth* scandal, it is no longer possible to accept political exigency as the only motivation for the turnabout.

Prominent Russian theorists have maintained that Shostakovich's pseudo-tonal scores of the early 1930s, including *Lady Macbeth*, the first Piano Concerto, the Piano Preludes, as well as the instrumental works composed after 1936, have all been resistant to the analytic techniques associated with common-practice harmony. Yet none of their various proposed solutions invoking bitonality, polytonality, chromatically altered diatonic modes, or a "Shostakovich mode" has met the task of explaining the remarkably consistent yet tonally elusive language of these scores.

In this paper I shall initiate a line of inquiry based on the hypothesis that an essential part of the motivation and technical means behind the stylistic redirection can be traced back to the triumphal reception of 1927 given to Alban Berg and *Wozzeck* by Leningrad's modernists and to Shostakovich's independent discovery of a structural secret behind the work's dazzling surface variety. Extracts from analytic and aesthetic essays published to coincide with the premiere will attest to the Leningraders' enthusiastic endorsement of Berg's heterogeneous musical language. I shall then assess Shostakovich's resourceful employment in several works of the seminal referential collection labeled *Schlufakkord* by Berg: while preserving the same transposition level, Shostakovich pursues different compositional ends, which are more in keeping with Russian traditions and his needs of the moment.

## BATTLES OF VISION AND REASON: BUSSOTTI'S GRAPHIC SCORES, PARTS, AND CORRECTIONS

Paul Attinello  
University of Hong Kong

Sylvano Bussotti, Italian composer of the avant-garde, wrote several important graphic scores between 1958 and 1966 while involved with Darmstadt summer courses. These scores, all drawn onto transparencies without the intervention of a copyist, include both traditional and new elements of notation enhanced by innovative 'page' images and an artistic skill that sets them above other graphic scores. Examination of manuscripts and papers held by Ricordi and the Getty Museum shows surprising creative processes and methodological disagreements, clarifying the changing interface between rational and indeterminate composition in the early 1960s.

*Due voci* (1958) started out as a partially graphic score with multiple simultaneous (and complex) meters. In helping an inexperienced Bussotti to create parts and a non-graphic performance score, Pierre Boulez corrected the original with a heavy hand, rationalizing meters and groupings to a more 'sensible' scheme. Bussotti responded by publishing a modified version of his original, retaining the normalized score as rental material; then, in 1985, he created a new version that uses certain of Boulez's corrections but ignores others.

Bussotti's later scores, especially *Pièces de chair II* (1958–60) and the *Sette fogli* (1959), were 'processed' by Ricordi in order to create ensemble parts and meticulously interpreted by pianist David Tudor in order to arrive at a valid performance practice. Finally, the various revisions and transcriptions of *La passion selon Sade* (1965–66) reflect the intricate climax of this period of graphic experimentation and Bussotti's increasing ability to defend his works against traditional preconceptions about the nature of the musical score.

**MUSIC AND MILITARY CULTURE IN EARLY MODERN EUROPE**  
**Martha Feldman, University of Chicago, Chair**

**“OGNI AMANTE È GUERRIER”: OVID, RINUCCINI, MONTEVERDI,  
 AND A SIXTEENTH-CENTURY WARRIOR SINGER**

Richard Wistreich

Royal Holloway College, University of London

Rinuccini's poem “Ogni amante è guerrier” is a free translation and expansion of Ovid's *Amores* 1.9. Central to both poems is the concept of “otium”—literally the studied state of leisure or laziness—the pursuit of which was hotly contested in the “Arms versus Letters” debate of 16th-century courtiership books. Should, and could, the active life of a soldier be combined with the contemplative study of letters?

Rinuccini created a character who is part middle-aged, Pantalone-like lover-singer, part warfare-obsessed Capitano, and who conjures in the course of his monologue the seemingly impossible marriage of two worlds: war and singing. In Monteverdi's setting, this character must display the pyrotechnic virtuosity of late-Renaissance solo bass vocal technique. One of the first exponents of this art was Giulio Cesare Brancaccio, a soldier-courtier who was, at different times, director of fortifications to the French king and singer in the earliest manifestations of the “musica secreta” at Ferrara. Eventually driven to despair by the tensions of being both a man of arms and a poet-singer, he was in fact a living embodiment of the fictional protagonist of Rinuccini's poem. Based on my research into Brancaccio's career and into solo bass-singing, I suggest that Monteverdi's setting recalls him and his performances with conscious reference to his dual careers as virtuoso soldier and singer. The battle between Arms and Letters is a key to a full understanding of Brancaccio's struggle for identity, of the mixed lyrical and concitato styles of Monteverdi's setting, and of the social science of court music-making in the late Renaissance.

**MILITARY DRILL AND FENCING TO MUSIC IN  
 LATE-RENAISSANCE FRANCE (CA. 1580–1620)**

Kate van Orden

University of California, Berkeley

Gunpowder revolutionized warfare, arming plebeians with matchlocks and pushing aristocrats off the battlefield. From the sidelines, nobles such as Maurice of Orange developed drills that taught gunmen to load and fire in time (a procedure requiring 42 separate commands) and pikemen to advance during reloading. At this time—ca. 1600—music became important to command, for trumpets, pipes, and drums relayed orders and coordinated drills.

William McNeill (*Keeping Together in Time*) argues that drill bonded infantrymen together at the muscular level, initiating *esprit de corps* through rhythmic training of the body. In this light, I reconsider France's first dance treatise, *Orchésographie* (1588), and show how its marches and militaristic ballet—usually ignored by scholars—cultivate the new technologies of war.

As gunpowder eroded the associations between martial skills and nobility, valor in war diminished, and the older chivalric arts were instead confined to ceremonial forms. *Orchésographie* closes with a Pyrrhic ballet (ancient Roman swordplay choreographed to music [ref. Plato, Lucian, Mercurialis]). Pyrrhic dance celebrated traditional swordsmanship even as it rehearsed the synchronized fighting newly required in battle. My research presents five Pyrrhic ballets performed at court before 1620.

Drilling to drums, fencing to dance tunes, and even social dancing (which Henry III encouraged with three balls a week) promoted effective command, since in these activities individuals surrendered their personal will and merged into a group of fellow subordinates moving in time to and ruled by the kinesthetic force of the king's music. What revolutionized command on the battlefield thus undid the military nobles at home, for Pyrrhic dance in this way subjugated them to royal power.

#### MILITARY CULTURE AND PHILOSOPHY OF IMAGE: LES SONNERIES DU PÈRE MÉNESTRIER

Philippe Vendrix

Centre d'Études Supérieures de la Renaissance

Claude-François Méneestrier, an indefatigable polygraph, was an ardent Jesuit and among the most militaristic of his religious brothers. Conscious that political ceremony belonged to the tradition of urban life as well as to that of the monarchy, he imagined a pedagogy of the street that would integrate public festivities and theater, Christians and aristocrats. There he had a territory to reconquer. For since the publication of *The Courtisan françois* in 1612, music had been reduced to a secondary activity in the education of aristocrats, future members of the royal army. Méneestrier's program, elaborated in works from the *Traité des Tournois, Joustes, et Carrouselles* (1669), to *Des Représentations en Musique anciennes et modernes* (1681), restored music to political ceremony, thereby calling attention to the unique social, symbolic, and musical role of military aristocrats in the support of state.

Méneestrier's project was a historical one that reached back into the fading traditions of chivalric culture in order to revive spectacles such as tournaments and jousts, invigorating them with music. Music, he believed, was a necessary complement to the visual aspects of public display, and one particularly suited to glorify the military—and Jesuit—culture of action. Training the body in sport and arms and exhibiting this training in public supported both the active lifestyle long associated with the supremacy of military aristocrats and with the educational philosophy of the Jesuits. As alternatives to the *tragédie en musique* and *ballet de cour*, Méneestrier's spectacles paraded the king's army under the sacred banner of the church.

#### BATTLE SYMPHONIES AND THE FORMATION OF SOCIAL MEMORY IN NAPOLEONIC EUROPE

Richard Will  
University of Washington

In recent years Joseph Connerton (in *How Societies Remember*) and other historians have emphasized how shared bodily movements help to preserve communal memories. Their research opens a needed perspective on battle symphonies of the Napoleonic era, long dismissed as profit-driven titillations for a safely non-combatant bourgeoisie. More was at stake than that: battle symphonies sought to shape social memories by encouraging listeners to associate military victories with shared kinesthetic experiences.

Referring to two dozen works from this period but focusing on those celebrating the victories at Vittoria (Beethoven's *Wellingtons Sieg*, 1813) and Leipzig (symphonies by Peter von Winter, 1813, and Johann Friedrich Reichardt, 1814), I show how battle symphonies used a progression of implied physical movements to guide their audiences' vicarious participation in war. They begin and end with marches or powerfully rhythmic patriotic songs, which, in addition to connoting the specific armies involved, invoke the communal rhythmic discipline of military drill. In between comes music meant to represent the fighting itself, characterized by irregular surface and phrase rhythms along with wildly fluctuating dynamics and chromatic key juxtapositions. Hence listeners "feel" each battle kinetically as a descent from rhythmic order into disorder and each victory as a return to order. They are encouraged to remember not so much a particular engagement as a general pattern by which military action ensures social harmony. In listening to battle symphonies, communities memorialized a successfully defended social order by moving together to musical rhythms.

*Friday afternoon, 5 November*

**RENAISSANCE TOPICS**  
**Bonnie J. Blackburn, Oxford University, Chair**

**ARCHITECTURE AND COUNTERPOINT**  
**IN THE FIFTEENTH CENTURY**

Graeme M. Boone  
Ohio State University

After ca. 1400, French architectural design enters into a new aesthetic, building on traditional Gothic approaches of stratification and modularity, but also moving beyond them in order to pursue a radical organicism and interpenetration of elements. In northern polyphony after 1400, a similar evolution takes place: building on late-medieval traditions of heterogeneous and modular construction, contrapuntal technique evolves toward a radical new level of dissonance control, together with an organic integration of voices. These two developments, one in architecture and one in music, are analogous and resonant with one another, and they originate in the same broad cultural sphere. But in modern times they have attracted diverging interpretations, the architectural style viewed as a vestige of an essentially northern medievalism while the musical style is commonly identified with the Renaissance as a new and distinct historical period, connected to Italy. Close study of the analogy between 15th-century northern architecture and music encourages us to shatter such stereotypes and offers hope, by the same token, of a more sympathetic grasp of northern cultural trends in this period, which constitute a dramatic and epochal achievement in their own right. At the same time, however, it raises profound questions about the value of analogy as a means to understanding, questions that have broader ramifications for the problem of historical explanation.

**THE MOTET CYCLES OF THE GAFFURIUS CODICES**  
**AND THE NEW STATUS OF THE MOTET**  
**IN LATE-FIFTEENTH-CENTURY ITALY**

Nolan Gasser  
Stanford University

The Gaffurius Codices (MilD 1–4) are celebrated for their *motetti missales*—cycles of motets setting discrete texts, which collectively substitute for items standard to the Roman Mass. A 1986 study by Lynn Ward demonstrated the existence of a more extensive and flexible repertory of motet cycles within the damaged fourth *Librone* and yet to date no systematic re-appraisal of the three surviving choirbooks has been offered. This paper revisits the question of motet cycles in the Gaffurius Codices, cataloguing 38 cycles, of which only 7 can be positively labeled *motetti missales*. These include 12 with motets drawn from other cycles, suggesting a scenario where composers and scribes worked jointly, augmenting, reducing, or altering existing cycles to suit a growing variety of liturgical and devotional needs. Two newly recognized cycles (from MilD 3) expand previous conceptions about the function of the Milanese cyclic repertory: *Beata et venerabilis Virgo*, composed for an Ambrosian Mass, and *Ave Regina caelorum*, composed for Roman Vespers.

The profusion of motet cycles in the Gaffurius Codices, moreover, exemplifies the overall elevation of the motet's stature in the late *quattrocento*, much as occurred with the Mass Ordinary cycle a century earlier. Petrucci's motet publications, from *Motetti de passione* (1503) to *Motetti libro quarto* (1505<sup>2</sup>), and numerous Italian MSS ca. 1480–1500, offer a surge of motet cycles and multi-movement motets that evince a conscientious attempt to expand the profile and function of the genre—mirroring the contemporary increase in votive and paratitular activities.

MUSIC AND SPIRITUAL COMBAT IN  
COUNTER-REFORMATION ITALY

Robert Judd

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

Lorenzo Scupoli's popular devotional volume *Combattimento Spirituale* (Venice, 1589), written in the wake of St. Ignatius Loyola's profound reform movement, presents a rule of life based on the metaphor of warfare which includes a consideration of music: if life in the world is an inward spiritual battle between the individual and Satan, one must beware of the danger of corruption from sensual pleasure misdirected, thus "do not allow your senses to go freely where they will, and do not make use of them when mere pleasure, and no good end or usefulness or necessity, moves you to do it. . . . When you hear any harmony of music and singing, having turned in mind to your God, you will say: 'How much I rejoice, O my Lord and my God, at Your infinite perfections, which not only all together produce in You more than heavenly harmony, but also in union with the angels, the heavens, and with all creation make marvelous music!'"

I consider the ramifications of Scupoli's attitude toward music, and demonstrate that this was an attitude in currency among the middle and upper classes of Italian society from before 1540 to well after 1600. Scupoli's volume is a strong indication of the spiritual revival of the Counter-Reformation, a movement that has tended to be ignored in musical studies. The usual interpretations of Counter-Reformation attitudes to music are based on the edicts of the Council of Trent, limited dicta concerned with the employment of secular music and the performance of texted music; Scupoli, however, shows concern for neither "profane" music nor polyphonic textures. Thus Counter-Reformation composition is better viewed as an element of a genuine spiritual revival that affected many supporters and listeners of music in late-16th-century Italy. The patronage of sacred music and musicians and the rise of the confraternity and oratorio music movements demonstrate the deep impact the Scupolian/Loyolist attitude—to remain in the world despite its spiritual dangers—made on the musical culture of the age.

VITTORIO BALDINI, *STAMPATORE DUCALE*:

FERRARESE MUSIC PRINTING IN THE LATE SIXTEENTH CENTURY

Buckley Harris Crist

Yale University

Vittorio Baldini, court printer to the Este in Ferrara, published 30 musical volumes in the late 16th century, including books of madrigals by Don Carlo Gesualdo, Luzzasco Luzzaschi and Alfonso Fontanelli. His music prints display unusual characteristics: colored paper, decorative borders, and the presentation of the poetic text before its musical setting. These strik-

ing, and costly, effects have led scholars to understand Baldini's music prints as products of, and intended for, the highest levels of the Este court.

Newly discovered evidence from the archives in Ferrara and Modena, however, suggests that Baldini's role as an elite court printer has been overemphasized. Through the study of his letters, his use of music type and paper, and court payment records, Baldini can be seen not as an adjunct to the Ferrarese court, but as a struggling commercial printer who turned to music to survive in a crowded market. That Baldini would look to music to bolster his faltering business speaks to the commercial viability of music publishing by the late 16th century. A fuller understanding of Baldini's publishing career has implications for the dissemination of the Ferrarese style, and it suggests that the first flowering of the *seconda prattica* madrigal, which issued from Baldini's printing presses in 1594, was not intended solely as *musica reservata*.

### SCHUBERT AND BRAHMS

Walter M. Frisch, Columbia University, Chair

#### SCHUBERT, MIGNON, AND THEIR SECRET

Sterling Lambert

Yale University

Schubert set over fifty poems to music more than once, yet this important aspect of his development as a composer of *Lieder* has perhaps received less attention than it deserves. Unlike his many revisions of songs, Schubert's resettings of poetry are often better understood as entirely new poetic readings, rather than simply modifications of an earlier setting. Schubert set most of the lyrics from Goethe's novel *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* repeatedly throughout his life. Several of these belong to the character Mignon, a mysterious girl with a secret whose terrible nature is not made clear until the end of the novel. Her lyric "Heiß mich nicht reden," while not overtly stating this secret, powerfully expresses an inner conflict between her urge to reveal and a duty to maintain silence.

Schubert set this poem twice, in 1821 and in 1826, and the two settings share many important musical features. In the first setting, these form an extremely ambivalent and elusive interpretation of Mignon's secret and the conflict this engenders; in the second setting, however, these same fundamental components are radically reused to create an alternative reading of the poem that is more hermeneutically focused, and ultimately more tragic. The difference between these two songs as poetic readings may perhaps be understood in the light of a catastrophic event that occurred between them, Schubert's contraction of syphilis in 1822. This illness seems to have constituted Schubert's own terrible secret, and may relate to his new understanding of Mignon's.

#### UNCOMPROMISING SCHUBERT

Kristina Muxfeldt

## Yale University

The libretto to Franz Schubert's final opera project, *Der Graf von Gleichen*, by his friend, the playwright Eduard von Bauernfeld, was banned by the Viennese censors for its sentimental celebration of bigamy. Despite the ban, Schubert completed a substantial draft of all the music up to the final scene; a friend reported that he remained preoccupied with the opera even on his deathbed. The story of a count who (with the pope's blessing!) takes two wives, a Christian woman and, later, an adolescent Persian girl, had in fact been repeated many times in German literature. Why should this version have been banned? A comparison with influential precedents—including Musäus, Grimm, Goethe and Kotzebue—reveals that Bauernfeld's treatment of the traditional tale differs substantially from previous renderings in its bald presentation of the count's double marriage as an enlightened solution to his predicament, without any of the usual mitigating circumstances, accidents, or framing strategies. The crux of Schubert's story lies in his characters' psychological journeys, from the initial stirring of feeling, through denial and dissembling, to eventual recognition, definition, and legitimization of the unique bonds between them. In successfully published contemporaneous literature, socially unaccepted relationships—including adulterous, homosexual, or bigamous unions—appeared only in exemplary tales (with acceptable moral outcomes) or else by means of narrative devices distancing the story from contemporary European culture. With uncompromising idealism Schubert's opera both defies these literary conventions and allies itself musically with such operatic celebrations of marital fidelity as *Fidelio* and *The Marriage of Figaro*.

THE CULT OF THE CLASSICAL ADAGIO  
AND BRAHMS'S "FIRST MATURITY"

Margaret Notley  
Katonah, New York

Musicologists have devoted relatively little attention to slow movements in the Classical and Romantic repertory. Those who have written about these movements have usually not differentiated between andantes and adagios, instead focusing their efforts on classifying them according to formal types and creative deviations from these. This paper maintains that "the adagio" should have a central place in musicological accounts of late-19th-century intellectual history.

With the canonization of the Classical repertory and the increasing number of performances of Beethoven's late quartets after 1850, the adagio seems to have achieved cult status. An elevated genre unto itself, it was distinguished not only by tempo but also by melodic style and quality of expression. After Wagner introduced the phrase *unendliche Melodie* in 1860, some musicians found that it conveyed their conception of the adagio. At the same time, musicians wrote of the extreme difficulty of composing adagios. While Brahms struggled with the genre, he produced more adagios than andantes between 1857 and 1865 (the years leading up to and encompassing the period that Tovey called his "first maturity"), a higher proportion than during any comparable period before the late 1880s. It may not have been an undifferentiated quest for originality that impelled the formal innovations in the adagios from Brahms's first maturity. Rather, those unusual forms may have been almost incidental

by-products in his response to the slow-movement aesthetic captured in the special understanding of “unendliche Melodie.”

PRE-PUBLICATION PERFORMANCES AND  
BRAHMS'S REVISIONS OF THE *FEST- UND GEDENKSPRÜCHE*, OP. 109

Virginia Hancock  
Reed College

For the Hamburg premiere of the three double-choir motets, Op. 109, in September 1889, members of the chorus used parts printed in haste by the firm of Simrock, and a manuscript score was prepared for the conductor, Julius Spengel. Later that year, Franz Wüllner requested permission to conduct a performance in Köln; Brahms agreed, but said that he wished to make extensive revisions. He had a new copy of the score made for Wüllner, incorporating a different ending for the first motet, and Simrock printed a new set of parts. After some further revisions, the *Sprüche* were published in February 1890.

Brahms's autograph manuscript contains the original version of the conclusion of the first motet, along with many layers of revisions. The changes that he made before the first performance are easy to identify, but there has appeared to be no possibility of disentangling the second and third stages of the revision process, since although the score and parts prepared for Spengel's performance survive, those made for Wüllner's performance have disappeared.

Recent work on the new critical edition of the Brahms motets has provided a solution. Hints about an unauthorized performance appear in the Brahms-Simrock correspondence, but the definitive evidence is another copy of the score, previously unrecognized as being significant, that belonged to Wilhelm Rust, director of the Leipzig Thomanerchor. With this discovery, the record of Brahms's revision process in Op. 109 is complete.

MUSICAL VISIONS

Lydia Goehr, Columbia University, Chair

MURDER AND SHIPWRECK IN GIACOMO MEYERBEER'S *L'AFRICAINÉ*

Gabriela Cruz  
Princeton University

How important was seeing to audiences of Grand Opera? According to Louis Veron, the eye reigned at the Opéra, where elaborate (and prohibitively expensive) *mise-en-scènes* kept the genre in favor with the Parisian public. To Berlioz also, the appeal of Meyerbeer's works to Parisians was mostly visual. As if to confirm the opinions of these two figures, *L'Africainé*, Meyerbeer's last opera, featured one specifically famous visual effect, on which Parisian periodicals commented abundantly: the ship in the third act was proclaimed to be (and later also studied) as a particularly spectacular feat of stage technology.

My paper treats *L'Africainé*'s ship as a case study on the role of media effects in French grand opera. I discuss the genetic history of the vessel and show that, contrary to current scholarly opinion, the conception of the ship as a media event not only occurred early in the creative genesis of the opera, but also became a shaping element in the dramaturgical design of the act, dominating the development of the plot and the musical design of its largest

ensemble — the septet preceding the ensemble finale. I draw from a wide variety of archival sources and sketch materials to show that the ship's dual status as a visual and an aural motif had wide implications for Meyerbeer's compositional process, and that this fact challenges the received critical opinion that the *mise-en-scènes* in Meyerbeer's operas merely flattered the unmusical, visually oriented tastes of the Parisian bourgeoisie.

## VENUS, THE QUESTING KNIGHT, AND THE ARMORED GIRL: EDWARD BURNE-JONES'S WAGNERIAN VISION

Theresa Muir  
Brooklyn, New York

Among the Victorian luminaries attending the May 1877 Wagner concerts in the Albert Hall was the great Pre-Raphaelite painter Edward Burne-Jones (1833–98). This extraordinary artist recognized that both he and Wagner were presenting visions of an alternate reality. Later, in 1884, Burne-Jones remarked that *Parsifal* evoked for him “the very sounds that were to be heard in the Sangraal Chapel—and I ought to know.” In a review of a recent exhibition, the *Daily Telegraph* referred to Burne-Jones as “the Wagner of Victorian painters.”

This paper investigates how Burne-Jones's palette of visual *Leitmotive* dovetails with Wagner's repertoire of thematic, cultural, and psychological trappings. Rather than illustrating plots or scenes from Wagner's operas, Burne-Jones drew subjects from the same well of myth, legend, and literature. In artworks such as *Laus Veneris* (a scene from the Tannhäuser legend), Burne-Jones transports the audience to an esoteric realm through subtle convergences of theme and symbol, joined to powerful sensual experience, much as did Wagner. Each employed a similar visual—or rather visionary—vocabulary of motifs or tropes that were obsessively repeated and developed; and each played a major role in advancing the late-19th-century artistic cult of the *femme fatale*, with powerful images of women who might be called “death goddesses.” Through their recreated, ahistorical worlds of the past, both artists prophesied a revolutionary millennial world with mingled hope and dread.

## JUGENDSTIL IN MUSIC AS SEEN IN *VER SACRUM* SONGS

Bonny H. Miller  
Southeastern Louisiana University

Fourteen *Lieder* published in *Ver Sacrum*, the journal of the Vienna Secession, provide striking contemporaneous evidence of a *Jugendstil* in music. Although journals such as *Ver Sacrum* and Munich's *Jugend* are revered as sources of the *Jugendstil*, their music has received little notice. Of the composers represented in *Ver Sacrum*, only Hugo Wolf is still familiar. The others were musicians of regional or national importance in Germany (d'Albert, Ansgore, Hausegger, Klose, Reiter, Schillings, Sommer, Stradal, Thuille, and Zumpe). Although FOURTEEN songs are too small a sampling to define a musical style, the *Ver Sacrum* settings can enhance our understanding of the *Jugendstil* in music.

Gustav Klimt, Josef Hoffmann, and other Secession artists created in *Ver Sacrum* a model of *Jugendstil* design. To present a synthesis of music, art, and poetry, THREE songs appeared in 1898, the first year of publication, but in 1901 an entire issue of *Ver Sacrum* was devoted to *Lieder* settings. Each song was printed within an illuminated design created by a Secession member. The artists probably chose a song from scores suggested by musical editor Josef

Reiter; thus, the repertoire may reflect his musical taste, but the designs prepared by Secession artists suggest a fresh perspective on a musical *Jugendstil*.

The quintessential feature of *Jugendstil* in the fine arts is the primary importance of the flowing line based on forms derived from nature, especially the motion of the line as it approaches abstraction. The *Ver Sacrum* songs have images from the text as subjects in most of the borders, but illustrations for two songs (Ansorge, d'Albert) use musical figures as design elements. In these two borders, the shape of the musical accompaniment figures has been abstracted and repeated many times. The artists (Hoffmann, Böhm) saw that the recurring accompaniment figures functioned like the repeated, flowing lines so fundamental to Art Nouveau styles. Recent critics have focused on melodic variants, harmonic motion, or colorful orchestration as the means that convey musical *Jugendstil*, but *Ver Sacrum* shows that Secession artists interpreted the accompaniment figures in *Lieder* as one source of flowing motion.

### THE PICTORIAL TURN AND THE BLINDING EFFECT OF MUSIC

Berthold Hoeckner  
University of Chicago

Music, Nietzsche claimed, creates images and destroys them. This paradox sheds a provocative light on the “pictorial turn” (W.J.T. Mitchell) in 20th-century culture, where images have assumed unprecedented powers of illusionism and simulation in film, television, and cyberspace. Because music can both enhance and undercut these powers—making us see anew while having a “blinding effect” (Siegfried Kracauer)—it becomes a carrier of pictorial memory as well as a catalyst of pictorial amnesia.

Four examples will be discussed. In film, the appropriation of Wagner’s “Ride of the Valkyries” for *The Birth of a Nation* and *Apocalypse Now* exemplifies a layered encoding of destructive heroism in audiovisual signs, by establishing new pictorial associations that compete with more traditional ones. Akira Kurosawa’s *Ran*, however, favors pure expression over signification by pitting the powerless weeping of all-seeing Gods against the powerful lament of a blind musician. In an advertisement for United Airlines, by contrast, master paintings “play” Gershwin’s *Rhapsody in Blue*, yet the eye-opening device of critical art—montage—is undone by the commercial miracle it creates. Finally, Yo Yo Ma’s *Inspired by Bach* seeks to free the solo cello suites from their reception as abstract music to be listened to with closed eyes by placing, paradoxically, the performer in the computer-simulated spaces of Piranesi’s prison engravings.

As new technologies spur the re-negotiation of the “audiovisual contract” (Michel Chion), an evolving “musicology of the image” (Andrew Goodwin) remains caught between music’s visual potency and the iconophobic legacy of absolute music.

### HEARING THE DANCE, SEEING THE MUSIC: BALLET, PANTOMINE, OPERA

Kathleen K. Hansell, University of Chicago Press, Chair

BALLET, PANTOMIME, AND THE SUNG WORD  
IN THE OPERAS OF RAMEAU

Rebecca Harris-Warrick  
Cornell University

Although no contemporary choreographies survive for any of the dances in Rameau's stage works, some scores and libretti offer provocative, if sparse, glimpses of the choreographic practices of the day. The seemingly contrary tendencies in the Parisian dance world between the radical expansion in virtuosic, abstract entrées (dance for its own sake) on the one hand and the move toward expressive pantomime on the other (called "ballet figuré" by librettist and dance theorist Cahusac) co-existed in Rameau's operas and ballets; annotations in the scores show how both kinds of dance could encroach upon vocal territory, in comparison with the Lullian conventions that had tended to keep singing and dancing temporally separate. The new fluidity promoted a more dramatic expression of dancers' traditional role as surrogate bodies for the immobile chorus and even allowed for choreographic units as short as a single measure, with dance entering into dialogue with sung texts.

Indications in the score showing how the dance was interleaved into a primarily vocal context or what a dance was intended to express ("le ballet exprime la réconciliation des amants") belie the common perception that dance in opera was purely decorative, yet such scenes were often counterbalanced within the same work by celebratory divertissements consisting of long strings of purely instrumental dances. This paper thus examines the ways dance interacted with the vocal realm in light of the tensions inherent in Rameau's works between abstract dance and *ballet figuré*.

DANCE, BALLET, AND PANTOMIME: HEARING THE DIFFERENCE?

Carol G. Marsh  
University of North Carolina, Greensboro

Choreographic reformers of the second half of the 18th century—Angiolini, Noverre, and others—argued that dance should express meaning and have narrative content. The use of pantomime or pantomimic gestures played an important role in this new art form. However, even Noverre recognized that pantomime ballet could include other components; he mentioned both dance (abstract steps) and ballet (ensemble numbers utilizing changing floor patterns). Our understanding of how these various styles of movement are utilized in the second half of the 18th century is severely limited by the absence of surviving choreographic notation. Occasional ballet score annotations suggest that 1) closed musical forms were used for abstract dances and formal ensemble choreographies, whereas through-composed music, often more rhapsodic or programmatic in nature, accompanied pantomimic sections; and 2) each choreographic section used only one style of dance throughout.

Yet notated choreographies in a 1782 French manuscript provide a rather different picture of the relationship between music and theatrical dance. The choreographies use all three of Noverre's categories, but with much greater flexibility than one might suspect from the music alone: a closed musical form may include abstract step sequences, ensemble passages, and pantomimic gestures; and conversely, through-composed musical sections may accompany abstract dance passages. I will argue that late-18th-century French choreographies may have

been more fluid than is often assumed, moving freely from one dance style to another within the same piece of music; furthermore, musical style may not be a reliable indicator of choreographic style.

### SONGS OF DESIRE

Katherine Bergeron, University of California, Berkeley, Chair

#### FLESHING OUT BILITIS:

#### CONSTRUCTIONS OF GIRLHOOD IN DEBUSSY'S SONG CYCLE

Jacqueline Warwick

University of California, Los Angeles

Can Debussy's *Trois Chansons de Bilitis* be considered girls' songs? While they purport to be a frank confession of girlhood sexual experience, and must be realized by a female voice, they are in fact the issue of a union between two men; Pierre Louÿs and Claude Debussy were *flaneurs* fascinated by the hidden domain of girls. I am concerned in this paper with the image of girlhood constructed in this cycle, and interpreted by female singers from Debussy's day to our own.

Susan Youens has addressed the significance of phonetics in the *Trois Chansons*, and I draw on her observations in considering the ramifications of particular vowel shapes and pitches for different voice types. The low tessitura of the song cycle makes it particularly appealing to mezzo and adult soprano voices, but Debussy intended it to be sung by a light, adolescent voice like that of many of his young singing students. The cycle is thus as much a project about the development of the soprano voice as it is about a girl's awakening sexuality.

Louÿs's literary creation and Debussy's song setting conjure an ephemeral and shadowy figure on the brink of womanhood, but a performance of the song cycle relies on a real woman's utterance, so that audience and performer are confronted with a physically present Bilitis. I will consider the appeal to voyeurs of the *Trois Chansons*, but also the extent to which Bilitis and her songs have been and are empowering to girls and women.

#### THE CROONING VOICE: AURAL DESIRE AND IMAGINARY INTIMACY IN *GOING HOLLYWOOD*

Christina L. Baade

University of Wisconsin, Madison

In January of 1932, Cardinal O'Connell of Boston made national news by lambasting radio crooning as "a low-down source of sexual influence." According to critics, crooning stimulated illicit desire in audiences both because of its musical characteristics and the circumstances under which it was produced and consumed. The unprecedented sensitivity of the microphone made possible a variety of vocal nuances, which could be heard in the eroticized terms encompassed by the Barthesian notion of vocality. Moreover, the proximity of singer and microphone in the studio and the experience of private home listening created an auditory experience of unique—if illusory—intimacy. While early radio advertisers used crooners to personalize commercial formats and mobilize consumer desire, the perception of intimacy rested, ultimately, with individual audience members.

The 1933 film *Going Hollywood* dramatized this imaginary relationship between fan and celebrity crooner. Created as a vehicle for the declining silent film star Marion Davies, the musical features Bing Crosby typecast as a radio baritone of questionable virtue. Although the camera organizes the audience's gaze around the actress, the plot dramatizes the fictional fan's—as well as the audience's—response to the crooner's voice. Drawing on film critics including Silverman, Chion, and Williams, this paper will argue that *Going Hollywood* registers an historical moment when aural desire for the male crooner overshadowed visual desire for the female movie star. This discussion will contribute to larger questions of how the early institutions of radio, celebrity, and film shaped the musical soundscape of American popular modernity.

### SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY CHURCH MUSIC

Steven E. Saunders, Colby College, Chair

#### A REPERTORY OF *PETITS MOTETS*: SACRED MUSIC FOR WOMEN AT THE CONVENT SCHOOL AT SAINT-CYR

Deborah Kauffman

University of Northern Colorado

The convent school of Saint-Louis at Saint-Cyr was steeped in rich musical traditions begun by its first music master, Guillaume-Gabriel Nivers (1632–1714), and reflected in the large repertory of *petits motets* from the late 17th and early 18th centuries that were written specifically for the institution. The performance practices at Saint-Cyr resulted in a style of motet composition that was continued well into the 18th century by Nivers's successors, in particular, Louis-Nicolas Clérambault (1676–1749).

The development of Nivers's motet style can be traced by studying the different versions of his Saint-Cyr motets that appear in sources ranging from the 1686 print *Offices divins* and a 1709 manuscript, to later collections, including the 1733 publication *Chants et motets*. Nivers's earliest motets resemble chant and seem to have been written with the limited resources of the new institution in mind. Once instruction in singing was established, he revised earlier motets and composed new ones for soloists and a one- or two-voice chorus. This texture was ideally suited to the performance forces and needs of the institution, and was taken up by Clérambault for his own Saint-Cyr motets.

That Nivers's conservative style of motet composition continued well into the 18th century is remarkable, since it was abandoned even during his lifetime: composers after 1700 generally wrote *petits motets* resembling the French cantata, a genre for which Clérambault was justly famous. But performance traditions at Saint-Cyr continued to define the institution's repertory even until its demise during the French Revolution.

#### THE *SCHWANENGESANG*: THE RELIGIOUS CONVERSION OF A PAGAN MYTH IN EARLY MODERN GERMANY

Gregory S. Johnston

## University of Toronto

Works for weddings and funerals constitute the most frequent types of occasional music written by German composers of the 17th century. While Venus, Coridon, Cupid and Orpheus regularly appear in the texts of wedding music, figures from Greek and Roman antiquity are studiously avoided in funerary compositions. The notable exception to this rule is the *Schwanengesang* (swan song), which is generally understood as the last work of a composer or artist. Despite the familiarity of the *Schwanengesang*, however, no attention has been given either to its origins or its significance in terms of Western musical traditions.

This paper first examines the Lutheran Church's universal acceptance of the pagan myth. Lutherans created a Christian and entirely Protestant parallel to the death of Socrates, as recounted in Plato's *Phaedo*, who compared his own death to that of a swan. Lutherans achieved this by conjoining texts from Luke (*Canticum Simeonis*) and Revelations (*Sanctus*), two of the most popularly set texts in the funerary repertoire. The swan, moreover, was generally seen as an emblem of Luther himself.

Using printed funeral sermons, funerary poetry, curricula vitae, printed music, court records and theological tracts, the paper subsequently surveys the extent to which Lutherans consciously enacted the myth of the swan in music, ranging from singing hymns on one's deathbed to composing one's own *Schwanengesang*. By studying the *Schwanengesang* in the cultural context of its time, one can better understand the motivations and intent underlying significant works by such composers as Michael Praetorius, Johann Hermann Schein and Heinrich Schütz.

**MUSICAL POLITICS BEHIND THE IRON CURTAIN****Pamela Potter, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Chair****BARTÓK'S CONCERTO FOR ORCHESTRA AND THE  
DEMISE OF HUNGARY'S "THIRD WAY"**

Danielle Fosler-Lussier

University of California, Berkeley

The Hungarian premiere of Bartók's *Concerto for Orchestra* (22 April 1947) evoked surprisingly mixed responses among Bartók's loyal followers. While avant-garde musicians regarded the Concerto's style as much too accessible, some communists and other leftist musicians heard the Concerto as deeply human music that might transcend boundaries of education and social class. Several Hungarian communists even expressed nationalist hopes that a new international socialist music would be created, not from Soviet models, but from Bartók's late style. Their optimism was reflected not only in their critical writings about the Concerto, but also in orchestral music composed between 1947 and 1949, as exemplified in Ferenc Szabo's "Homecoming" Concerto.

Although some Hungarian musicians continued to reinterpret Soviet musical policies to protect Bartók from socialist critiques of modernism, the Soviet-controlled Hungarian government began to denounce Bartók openly in 1949, publishing increasingly negative appraisals in Party periodicals. Relying on recently discovered archival documents and on published primary sources, I show that Soviet cultural imperialism played a central role in shifting the

focus of public discourse from what socialists considered Bartók's most acceptable work, the *Concerto for Orchestra*, to his least acceptable, *The Miraculous Mandarin*, thereby presenting Bartók as an unfit model for new Hungarian music. In accordance with this shift, many of Bartók's modernist works were banned from performance on Hungarian state radio between 1950 and 1955. Examination of these little-known but significant events illuminates the national and international conflicts that shaped musical practices during the politically volatile postwar period.

NATIONALOPER AND NATIONAL LEGITIMACY IN THE  
GERMAN DEMOCRATIC REPUBLIC:  
HANNS EISLER'S *JOHANN FAUSTUS*

Joy Haslam Calico  
Illinois Wesleyan University

"The German *Volk* await from their composers the results of that great task which is of crucial importance in our struggle for national unity and independence: the creation of a German *Nationaloper*." Thus ran the lead article in the 1 November 1952 issue of *Neues Deutschland*, the official organ of the Central Committee of the governing Socialist Unity Party in the GDR. The term *Nationaloper* represents an attempt to link the emerging East German state to the 19th-century German nation. This paper has two parts: the first examines official appropriation of the *Nationaloper* tradition in a campaign to use national cultural heritage as a public mediator for political legitimacy; the second investigates the fate of one opera in this context.

Hanns Eisler published his *Johann Faustus* libretto shortly before the *Neues Deutschland* essay appeared. Despite the traditional German subject, his text was attacked for being unpatriotic, and he never completed the musical setting. The surviving musical sketches have long been accessible, but his notes for the controversial libretto surfaced only recently. My analysis of these materials in the Hanns Eisler Archiv reveals that he sought to write an opera addressing the fate of a divided Germany. Furthermore, a recording of the single complete *Lied* from *Johann Faustus* provides evidence of the musical style Eisler planned to use. These sources suggest that his aborted opera might have been precisely what the Central Committee had in mind, had he been able to complete it.

*Friday evening, 5 November*

## PANEL DISCUSSION

### EDUCATION MOST SOVEREIGN: PERSPECTIVES ON MUSICAL PEDAGOGY AND LITERACY, 900–1600

**Susan Forscher Weiss, Peabody Conservatory, Johns Hopkins University, Chair**

**Colleen Baade, Duke University**

**Andrea Bornstein, University of Birmingham**

**Susan Boynton, University of Oregon**

**Cynthia Cyrus, Vanderbilt University**

**Russell Murray, University of Delaware**

**Rebecca Wagner Oettinger, University of South Carolina**

**Janet Pollack, University of Puget Sound**

**Christopher R. Wilson, University of Reading**

Musical education in the Middle Ages and Renaissance is a topic that warrants more rigorous examination. The session will begin with a brief overview by the chair, delineating the scope and magnitude of the topic and sketching an approach to future scholarship. The methodologies will include the sharing of bibliographies and source materials, seminars, interdisciplinary symposia, a collaborative volume of essays, and the creation of models for further studies. The current panel will explore issues relating to learning during the given time frame, focusing particularly on the conditions of education and on specific pedagogical sources. Questions of access and the various roles of age, social status, gender, and professional/amateur status are of particular interest for our understanding of the role of musical pedagogy in earlier cultures.

Susan Boynton will open the session with a glimpse into her work on the musical training of children in monasteries during the Central Middle Ages. Cynthia Cyrus will speak on musical literacy within Dominican women's convents in Germany in the 14th and 15th centuries. Colleen Baade will address the question of where and by whom women were trained for careers as nun musicians in 16th–17th century Spain. Moving toward the vernacular, Rebecca Wagner Oettinger will present a summary of her research on the use of popular song in the religious education of children and adults in Germany during the Protestant Reformation. The next two panelists will discuss the ways in which specific sources reveal patterns of musical pedagogy. Russell Murray will discuss the process of teaching composition and counterpoint in 16th-century Italy, concentrating on teaching strategies and materials as reflected in treatises and documents of the time. Christopher Wilson will describe how Thomas Campion's familiar and infallible rule for counterpoint claims to be a new way to teach grammatical composition and four-part harmony to young beginners. The remaining panelists will focus on sources of music whose purpose was primarily pedagogical. Janet Pollack will show how the early-17th-century English anthology *Parthenia* is a comprehensive compendium of keyboard music of the time and suggest how this book might have been used as a primer by aristocratic Jacobean women. Andrea Bornstein will close with some answers to his riddle, "Why did Phalèse make Lassus easier"? We will get a glimpse at how *bicinia* were used, first by Lassus in teaching the *pueri cantores* in Munich's ducal cappella and later by Phalèse, altered to suit the needs of a different audience.

*Saturday morning, 6 November*

**THE BRITTEN-AUDEN FILMS OF THE 1930S**  
**Stephen Hinton, Stanford University, Chair**

THE WONDERS OF INDUSTRIAL BRITAIN:  
*NIGHT MAIL* AND THE BRITISH DOCUMENTARY FILM MOVEMENT  
Jenny Doctor  
The Britten-Pears Library

When Benjamin Britten wrote the music for his first documentary film in 1935, he joined forces with an extraordinary group of people, whose political objectives and cultural aims profoundly influenced his artistic future. The men who shaped the British documentary film movement, in particular John Grierson, who was responsible for five films on which Britten collaborated, firmly believed that film's power to communicate to mass audiences should be used not merely for entertainment, but to promote ideological ends. The General Post Office Film Unit, established in 1933 and headed by Grierson, developed into a highly significant tool through which government departments and utility industries attempted to convey a socially progressive image to the general public.

As an introduction to the Britten-Auden films, this paper will examine the background to that development, considering: (1) the growth of image as a construct in interwar British society, (2) the dual influence of American advertising and Soviet propagandist techniques on that growth, and (3) the important place that contemporary art and artists played in building the image of a modern, progressive society.

film editing techniques and the employment of modern texts and music gave everyday topics in industrial society, such as transportation, gas meters, and telegrams, a sense of drama, interest and gritty appeal. The best known of the Britten-Auden documentaries, *Night Mail*, will be considered as an example of modern artists collaborating on projects that aimed to communicate and elevate mass audiences using the most modern means of expression and dissemination.

"AND LIGHT FALLS EQUALLY ON BLACK AND WHITE":  
BRITTEN'S AND AUDEN'S LONGEST JOURNEY

Paul Kildea  
The Britten-Pears Library

The poet Stephen Spender described the final scene of Auden's and Isherwood's *The Dog Beneath the Skin* as "a picture of a society defeated by an enemy whom the writers have not put into the picture because they do not know what he looks like . . ." It was a remarkably apt *aperçu* for much left-leaning art of the period: that there was an enemy, however, was never in doubt.

In the course of identifying this enemy in the film *God's Chillun*, I will analyze a number of themes in the Britten-Auden films. In each, a physical journey occurs which I will place in the context of the resurgence of travel writing in the 1930s. Yet despite this genre's vogue, Britten and Auden were less literal than their traveling colleagues: they used each journey as

a metaphor—for intellectual development, for social and political emancipation, and for movement away from the status quo.

The journey in *God's Chillun* is more ambitious than that in the other films. On one level, it documents agrarian culture in the West Indies; on another, it traces the history of the African slave trade. The concepts of exploitation and cultural imperialism this raises will be linked to two left-wing issues in 1930s Britain: race relations and the ideological oppression of capitalism. I will further analyze the manuscript version of the film ("Negroes")—uniquely, a through-composed dramatic piece—in terms of Britten's later operatic output.

WORDS, SOUNDS, IMAGES:  
THE INTEGRAL CONCEPT OF *COAL FACE*

Donald Mitchell  
The Britten-Pears Foundation  
Bruce Phillips  
Boydell & Brewer

In this paper we shall explore Britten's innovative integration of noise, words, and music in *Coal Face* to create a whole new fabric of sound—one quite unlike anything of the period, and one which in some respects anticipated the aims and aesthetic of *musique concrète*. Significantly, the film's division of the miner's world into two physical settings—below ground and above—is suggested in Britten's score by two distinct aural aesthetics: mechanical sounds and "noise" and the highly original treatment of text in the former, "traditional" music, conceived for chorus, for the human voice, in the latter.

We will further argue that Britten employed this new sound-world as an extension of his quickly maturing political views: the miner in 1930s Britain was idealized by the left as a symbol of primitive "innocence," as an example of the exploitative tentacles of capitalism, and as an exemplar of male community. We shall also briefly consider the experience Britten gained in documentary film and its impact on his evolution as a musical dramatist and in an important sense as a representative of musical "realism."

BRITTEN AND THE POETICS OF OTHERNESS

Valentine Cunningham  
Corpus Christi College, Oxford University

This paper is an inspection of Britten and his use of the verbal-textual. I argue that the 1930s leftist-liberal agenda is formative for the whole career: Britten's literary-musical interests and collaborations with writing and writers in the '30s lay down a kind of program for the whole life.

What preoccupies '30s Britten is a tightly knit set of concerns with various sorts of others—sexual (especially queer), working-class (the leftist view of class), alternative Englishnesses, and certain foreignnesses (especially American), that provide critiques of conventional Englishness. These make a kind of unity out of the various activities in Group Theatre, the GPO Film Unit, the interest in American popular culture, Pacifism, and the Spanish Civil War. These interests provide the basis for his developing and future work with texts of Crabbe, Michelangelo, Hölderlin, Melville, Owen, and the rest. All these major interests flow from the '30s agenda—it's Forster who suggests *Billy Budd*; Owen is a '30s hero; Hölderlin is

brought into British consciousness for the first time through '30s translations; the gay note is a prominent '30s sub-text; and so on. Central to my discussion will be the various aspects of the Auden friendship-collaboration.

A tendency towards transgressivity—sexual transgression, political transgression (the crossing of class and national boundaries), formal transgression (the mixture of media; the translation of words into music and music into words)—is what characterizes the '30s in general and '30s Britten in particular, and is what proves formative and continuative for the ongoing Britten.

**THEORY AND BUSINESS BEFORE 1700**  
**Jessie Ann Owens, Brandeis University, Chair**

HUMANISM AND THE LANGUAGE OF MUSIC TREATISES

Leofranc Holford-Strevens  
 Oxford University Press

By the 14th century, the style and technical vocabulary of music theory were reasonably settled; they owed little to ancient models, and their wider frame of intellectual reference was scholastic. This theoretical language came under challenge, not from new developments in music, which it could accommodate, but from humanistic pressure to write Latin according to classical canons of diction, even though large areas of the subject were not covered by classical writers.

An early glimmering of humanism is Ciconia's use of Greek pitch-names even in discussing psalm-tones; but he was obliged to strain the system in order to designate such pitches as high b flat. Others, notably Tinctoris, reserve their classicism for non-technical writings and passages, but even there use technical language when they need it; yet others, such as Florentius de Faxolis, attempt a classical style, but without eschewing unclassical technicalities such as the incorrectly formed verb *imperficere*. The same is true of Gaffurius, although in revising his treatise he classicizes his sentence-structure and dispenses with scholastic conceptions.

Whereas the extreme Ciceronian Paolo Cortesi invents a pseudo-antique terminology for music ("prosodies and analogical measures") and uses familiar terms (*pthongus modus*) in unfamiliar but classical senses, 16th-century theorists, even the humanist Glareanus, combine classical style and frame of reference with traditional terminology but introduce individual classicisms such as *commisura*, which means three different things in three different authors. Progress from this dead end could be made only in the vernacular.

A NEWLY-RECOVERED EIGHT-MODE MOTET CYCLE FROM THE  
 1540S: ZARLINO'S *SONG OF SONGS* MOTETS

Cristle Collins Judd  
 University of Pennsylvania

Although Gioseffo Zarlino is remembered primarily for his *Le Istitutioni harmoniche* (1558), he published 22 motets nearly a decade earlier (19 appeared in his *Musici quinque vocum*). Modern scholars have studied these motets primarily as authoritative illustrations of Zarlino's teaching on mode and text setting (flury 1955, Lewis 1985, Harrán 1988, Rivera

1993). There is good reason for this emphasis: 1) the *Musici quinque vocum* includes printed dodecachordal modal labels, and 2) Zarlino's citations of these motets in the *Istitutioni* encourages an *a posteriori* understanding of these compositions in relation to his treatise.

Yet this perspective has obscured the traces of an eight-mode motet cycle contained within Zarlino's publications of 1549. I will show that Zarlino had undertaken an unprecedented setting of the entire book of *Song of Songs* as a large-scale, textually ordered cycle, drawing a direct parallel between the eight chapters of *Song of Songs* and the eight modes. The discovery of this cycle offers important evidence of compositional approaches to modal theory in mid-16th-century Venice. In addition, it offers a new perspective on Zarlino's adaptation of dodecachordal theory—a theory that undermined the very premises of this eight-mode cycle—soon after his encounter with it sometime between 1547 and the publication of these motets in 1549. Zarlino did not discard the motets in light of Glarean's theories but expediently cannibalized the cycle, successfully disguising the eight-mode origins of the motets by dispersing them among three prints; reordering them; and inserting unrelated motets between members of the cycle.

### BUSINESS UNUSUAL: MAKING MUSIC AND MONEY IN THE RENAISSANCE

John Kmetz  
Arthur Andersen, LLP, New York

As scholars of Renaissance music, we rightly spend much of our business day discussing and analyzing the achievements of those composers, musicians, printers and scribes who made music for a living. And then, in whatever time we have left, we place their accomplishments within a context. This context of ours is usually historical, cultural, political, sociological or religious. Seldom, if ever, is it predominantly economic. Yet, if one were asked to single out a significant change that occurred in the Renaissance, it would be the shift from demand-side to supply-side economics.

It is this macroeconomic shift, and its impact on the microeconomic business of making, performing, and transmitting music during the Renaissance, which will be the subject of my paper.

Focusing my attention on Central Europe, I will discuss how capitalism, commerce, merchant banking, and a burgeoning merchant class affected the makers and consumers of music alike. Emerging markets within the music industry will be identified, and several printers, composers and financiers who exploited them will be singled out. I will also deal with such business issues as risk management, portfolio diversification, productivity factors, and pension and investment planning as they pertain to those individuals who composed, performed, and printed music for a living during this incipient age of capitalism.

### CHRONICLES OF MUSICAL SUCCESS AND FAILURE IN LATE-SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY ITALY

Gregory Barnett  
University of Iowa

Apart from the music that we study, we know little of most 17th-century musicians. In documents that preserve their words—dedications, prefaces, or even treatises—musicians of

this period disclose few details of themselves and instead devote their prose either to musical issues or to the praise of their patrons. On the strength of an eclectic and little-known set of primary materials, this paper takes up the northern Italian musician's life during the latter half of the 17th century. The narratives assembled here treat the conflicts that arose between individual musicians and the organizations that provided their employment, the competition and consequent jealousies between musicians inherent in their milieu, the financial insecurity typical of the musician's life and the sometimes alarming consequences of errors made in the pursuit of a career, and the various and intricate means by which musicians sought to augment their earnings and improve their standing with patrons.

The materials that tell these tales originate in various sources: letters written by composers and performers to the powerful Bentivoglio family of Ferrara; musicians' petitions to municipal and ecclesiastical institutions in Bologna and Ferrara; *ordini* published by various musical *accademie* of northern Italy; and similar records of musical activity from the late 17th century. The larger aim of this study is to present an in-depth context for late-*Seicento* music by reconstructing the circumstances of rank-and-file musicians from this period, thereby illustrating how specific professional circumstances shaped their lives and influenced their music.

**NINETEENTH-CENTURY ITALIAN OPERA**  
**Roger Parker, Cambridge University, Chair**

**BELLINI'S SELF-BORROWING AS BODY LANGUAGE**

Mary Ann Smart

University of California, Berkeley

Bellini's reputation as the most "philosophical" of *bel canto* composers, the most attuned to poetic nuance, has always sat uneasily with the fact that he recycled his own melodies frequently, often in disparate dramatic contexts. Analysis usually reveals some poetic connection between a melody and its reworking, but a few cases, such as the recasting of a giddy soprano aria sung in anticipation of a wedding (in *Zaira*) as the bereaved Romeo's lament over Juliet's corpse (in *I Capuleti ed i Montecchi*), would seem to defeat even the most ingenious interpreter.

This paper will begin with an examination of the ways Bellini revised borrowed material and an attempt to establish what counted for him as a meaningful connection between words and music. Turning to some problematic cases such as the *Zaira/Capuleti* example mentioned above, I will propose that what appear as arbitrary borrowings emerge as explicable—and even eloquently expressive—if we understand the reuse of a melody as responding not just to words, but to a gesture or bodily spasm (such as tears or laughter) shared by the two numbers. The last section of the paper will extend this "gestural" approach from borrowing to allusion, focusing on Elvira's mad scene in *I puritani* and its echoes of Imogene's dream-narration in *Il pirata* to suggest a new dimension to Bellini's portrayal of the mad Elvira as at once disembodied voice and eroticized body.

“MAKING THEIR WAY THROUGH THE WORLD”:  
ITALIAN ONE-HIT WONDERS, 1825–1850

Hilary Poriss  
University of Chicago

Shortly after its premiere in 1826, Giovanni Pacini's *Niobe* fell from the rosters of Italian opera houses. The work did not suffer a complete demise, however. On the contrary, the tenor's entrance aria, “Il soave e bel contento / I tuoi frequenti palpiti,” went on to achieve a fame that was nearly unparalleled during the 1820s, '30s and '40s. We can gauge the vogue for this piece by taking into account the striking number of instances where singers inserted it into productions of other works such as Rossini's *Semiramide*, Donizetti's *L'elisir d'amore* and Mercadante's *Didone abbandonata*. As extant 19th-century librettos demonstrate, the aria was introduced into no fewer than sixteen different operas by as many famous sopranos and tenors between 1827 and 1845.

In this presentation, I examine the ubiquitous nature of “Il soave e bel contento” and other arias such as Nicolini's “Or che son vicino a te” and Persiani's “Nell'ebbrezza dell'amore” against the larger contexts of aria interpolation during these years. While scholars have attributed the existence of “borrowed arias” (a.k.a. “trunk arias” or “arie di baule”) primarily to the haughty whims of individual singers, the continual reappearance of a select handful of pieces strongly suggests that they were also often markers of a specific public demand. By tracing their transmission and reception through a variety of productions, this study offers a fresh view of why borrowed arias appeared in the bel canto repertory, and of how economics and aesthetics interacted to influence which pieces singers inserted.

VERDI THE BOHEMIAN: BOITO'S *OTELLO*

Rosa Solinas  
St. Cross College, Oxford University

One of the biggest scandals in the history of Italian criticism is the void left by the *scapigliatura*, the iconoclastic cultural movement active mainly in Milan in the 1860s and '70s. Traditionally dismissed as a motley bunch of social and political dreamers, the *scapigliati*, the disheveled ones, voiced a rhetoric of rebellion, death, and illness as a reaction to failed Risorgimento values and cultural provincialism, perpetually in conflict with the prospering bourgeoisie, capitalism, and Catholicism. Arrigo Boito (1842–1918), a major exponent of the *scapigliatura*, survived the anticonformist phase, unlike many colleagues who fell victim to drug abuse or suicide; he achieved fame and riches with his controversial opera *Mefistofele*, and went on to collaborate with the conservative establishment represented by Verdi, a figure he had roundly condemned in his youth.

This paper questions the apparent discontinuity between the young bohemian and the successful conservative, suggesting that Boito's collaboration with Verdi was an act of *scapigliatura* subversion beyond his erstwhile colleagues' wildest dreams. Studies of the genesis of the Verdi librettos have hitherto focused either on the differences between Boito and Shakespeare, or on the influence of intermediate texts such as F.V. Hugo's French translations. But the emergence of further intertexts threads a new narrative into the Boito-Verdi collaboration. For example, a reading of Boito's short stories and critical writing, published in Milanese periodicals between 1862–1874, casts unexpected light on *Otello*, bringing in

disturbing references to Dante's *Comedy*, and giving the alliance with Verdi the flavor of a mission.

NEW LETTERS ON VERDI'S *LA BATTAGLIA DI LEGNANO* AND  
*UN BALLO IN MASCHERA*: THE TRUE FUNCTION OF  
THE ROMAN SYSTEM OF CENSORSHIP

Andreas Giger  
Indiana University

In the 1840s and '50s, four operas by Giuseppe Verdi (*I due Foscari*, *La battaglia di Legnano*, *Il trovatore*, and *Un ballo in maschera*) received premieres in Roman opera houses. Two of these works (*I due Foscari* and *Un ballo in maschera*) had been rejected at other theaters because the authorities did not consider them concordant with the requirements of their censorship, and none of the four should have been permitted in Rome had the authorities applied the usual rigorous standards of censorship. These astonishing Roman premieres would thus seem to be inexplicable.

Newly discovered letters concerning *La battaglia di Legnano* and *Un ballo in maschera* prove that, contrary to expectation, the application of censorship was not strict but could be quite arbitrary. In fact, Verdi's prestige as Italy's leading active composer granted him special privileges. These letters, written by important Roman authorities (in the case of *La battaglia di Legnano*) and by the impresario of the Teatro Apollo, Vincenzo Jacovacci (in the case of *Un ballo in maschera*), show the intervention of high officials on Verdi's behalf to circumvent Roman standards of censorship.

The procedural inconsistencies raised by these letters must lead to a reevaluation of the main function of censorship. Interpretation in the context of theatrical contracts and regulations and the organization of the *Deputazione dei pubblici spettacoli* make it possible to support John Rosselli's hypothesis that censorship was not primarily concerned with emending librettos but rather with maintaining a social status quo.

**JAZZ**

**Scott DeVeaux, University of Virginia, Chair**

"KANSAS CITY BREAKDOWN": JAZZ, IDENTITY, AND AUTONOMY IN  
AN AFRICAN-AMERICAN COMMUNITY

Marc Rice  
Truman State University

The development of Kansas City jazz style ca. 1925–1945 has been attributed by scholars to the *laissez-faire* attitude of white politicians towards vice in the city's African-American entertainment venues. However, this is only part of the story. The city's black audience supported jazz not just in illicit clubs, but also at formal dances, charity benefits, and elite social events, to name just a few places with no connection to crime where the music was featured.

The nature of the stratification between illicit and legitimate venues is revealed by the "Kansas City Call," the city's African-American newspaper, and is described by musicians and audience members. Articles, advertisements, and interviews demonstrate distinctions

between a lower class and an elite class in the black community, each of which supported the music, but in different places. While the lower class heard the music in gambling or drinking establishments, such as the notorious Yellow Front, the elites held charity balls and formal cotillions at black-owned ballrooms like the Paseo Hall. The best bands in the region played in both venues.

The need to perform for different types of audiences shaped Kansas City jazz style. The competitive nature of improvisation in the city's illicit venues is well known, but the musicians' skills at sight-reading, arrangement, and ensemble play grew primarily from experience at the formal dances, an aspect rarely discussed. A discussion of recordings by the Bennie Moten Orchestra reveals a strong connection between the class distinctions of their audience and their development as a group.

### JOHN COLTRANE: MUSICAL ROOTS OF HIS TENOR SAXOPHONE STYLE, 1950–54

Carl Woideck  
University of Oregon

When saxophonist John Coltrane joined Miles Davis's quintet in 1955, he had to a significant degree already assimilated his earlier musical influences and was well on his way to establishing a distinct improvisational style. Coltrane's well-known recorded work from 1955 to 1967 has been exhaustively transcribed and extensively analyzed. However, his earlier 1950–54 developmental improvisations on tenor saxophone have not been analyzed or discussed in sufficient detail, perhaps because most of the recordings of Coltrane's work of this period are nonprofessionally-recorded live performances that have never been legitimately issued and have only been available on unauthorized bootleg LPs and CDs.

This paper examines Coltrane's improvisational style from his earliest recordings on tenor sax in 1950 through 1954, and traces the musicians and styles that influenced Coltrane during that period. The musical sources are both unauthorized and authorized recordings and include several early Coltrane performances that have never been issued in either authorized or bootleg form. Through transcription and musical analysis of early Coltrane solos, comparisons with improvisations by other modern jazz tenor saxophonists, and through Coltrane's own statements, a more complete picture of his early musical development emerges. We see Coltrane moving away from the influence of Charlie Parker and considering the styles of Lester Young, Dexter Gordon, Wardell Gray, and Sonny Stitt, as well as adopting a rhythm and blues approach to improvisation when the setting calls for it. Understanding of this developmental process helps illuminate both Coltrane's early work and his art as a whole.

### COOL CONTAINMENT: JAZZ, WHITENESS, AND CULTURAL POLITICS DURING THE EARLY COLD WAR

Dale Chapman  
University of California, Los Angeles

Within the context of jazz history, the movement known as “cool jazz” holds an idiosyncratic position. One of the few styles of jazz to be performed predominantly by white performers, cool jazz had emerged by the early 1950s as a more restrained manifestation of bebop, drawing its aesthetic impetus from its performers’ preoccupation with intellectualism and the creation of a subdued atmosphere, ostensibly free of emotional engagement.

How, then, might we come to understand this aesthetic of coolness in the greater context of mid-century American history? The period extending from the end of the Second World War through to the end of the 1950s saw some of the most dramatic ideological shifts in recent American history. As has been stated by Elaine Tyler May, at all levels of American society in this period, an emphasis was placed upon the necessity for containment, for a firm segregation of corruption and ideologically unsound thought from the ethical constitution of law-abiding Americans.

Drawing upon published jazz criticism of the time, as well as evidence from the music itself, I will attempt to situate the music of the “cool school” at the crossroads of a series of discourses contemporaneous with the early years of the Cold War. I am particularly interested in revealing the various ways in which this style tends to uphold white cultural values as normative, thereby using ostensibly universal aesthetic criteria as a means of advancing ideological containment.

## THE ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF CREATIVE MUSICIANS: A QUESTION OF MUSICAL DEFINITION

Nanette de Jong  
Rutgers University

The Association for the Advancement of Creative Musicians (commonly referred to as the AACM) is a Chicago-based musicians’ collective that evolved in the mid 1960s for purposes of instilling self-esteem and self-awareness among its members and the African-American community at large. AACM members relied upon various African traditions and cultures, creating via their performances a “hybrid” concept of African identity, combining stage action, spoken word, exotic dress, and sound to reinvent African-like festivals. Free from traditional norms and independent of pre-set musical patterns, compositions by AACM members emphasized the individuality of the musicians’ own unique voices. As the distinct AACM sounds emerged, so too did the debate on the genre placement of AACM compositions. Labels such as “Free Jazz,” “Schoenberg Imitators,” “Noise Makers,” and the AACM’s own choice, “Great Black Music,” evolved as descriptive terms for the music of the AACM.

This paper examines the debate on musical definition and the AACM. It introduces the various opinions of past and contemporary music critics. However, whereas prior discussions on the debate often neglect the views of the AACM musicians, this paper culminates with a series of oral narratives offered by organization members, their words vividly expressing how they want their music viewed and, ultimately, analyzed by music critics and historians.

**LISZT**

**Rena C. Mueller, New York University, Chair**

## SABRE OF DISHONOR? LISZT AND THE MAGYAR NATIONALISTS IN 1840

Dana Gooley  
Princeton University

Liszt's return to Hungary in 1840, after an absence of eighteen years, marked a peak of his virtuoso career. Biographers have traditionally attributed the immense public enthusiasm to Hungarian nationalism, since the highlight of his visit was a heady patriotic ceremony in which six Hungarian men of distinction presented him with the "Sabre of Honor."

Revising previous scholarship, I argue that the Sabre represented only the interests of the "cultural Magyar" nationalists, and not the entire Hungarian public. Two other understandings of nationhood in Hungary relate to Liszt's reception in Pest. First, most ethnically German or Slav Hungarians supported a "civic Hungarian" national identity that respected cultural and linguistic autonomy, and their opposition to the Magyar nationalists flared up on two occasions during Liszt's visit. Second, the high aristocrats, who played a leading role in his reception, valued him as an elegant cosmopolitan and harbored disdain for the Magyarizing gestures of the nationalists. The Hungarians were thus not united with regard to Liszt, but held competing investments in him that they fought out in a prolonged controversy over the Sabre. This paper complements recent studies on the aggressive and competitive aspects of romantic nationalisms (R. Taruskin, P. Gay) with a discussion of how the ethnic chauvinism of the Magyar nationalists affected Liszt's Hungarian reception, and why his virtuoso *persona* was prone to bring out this chauvinism.

## WHO ORCHESTRATED LISZT'S WORKS?

Jay Rosenblatt  
University of Arizona

It has become a commonplace in the secondary literature that Liszt did not know how to orchestrate prior to his arrival at Weimar in 1848. This assertion was never made during his lifetime but first appeared in a biography of Joseph Joachim published in 1898. Here it was alleged that Joachim Raff did this work for Liszt because he was incapable of doing it himself. Manuscript evidence appears to support this assertion, and the impression left is of a virtuoso pianist, poorly trained as a musician and ill-equipped to compose symphonic music. A fresh inquiry produces a significantly different picture.

This paper begins with a review of the secondary sources and examines them in light of recent research, especially the author's own into Liszt's manuscripts. I also survey Liszt's career prior to 1848 and demonstrate that he not only had ample opportunity for well-rounded musical instruction, including orchestration, but had competently orchestrated several works, two of which were performed.

The centerpiece of this discussion will be Liszt's Piano Concerto No. 1, a work singled out as having been orchestrated by Raff. Manuscript sources for the concerto include full scores in hands other than Liszt's, one of which is indeed Raff's, but a close examination demonstrates that all of these scores are copies that can be traced to autographs. By providing a new look at the primary sources, this paper corrects a long-held misconception about Liszt.

## AMANUENSIS OR AUTHOR?

## THE LISZT-RAFF COLLABORATION REVISITED

Paul A. Bertagnolli  
University of Houston

Liszt's reliance upon copyists throughout his career and in every stage of the compositional process aroused controversy only after his death, when published letters impugned his authorship by suggesting others had orchestrated his symphonic works. Thereafter, compelling testimony from three members of the Weimar *Hofkapelle* during the 1850s—concertmaster Joseph Joachim, principal cellist Bernard Cossmann, and the scribe Joachim Raff—has informed the secondary literature's highly partisan criticism. Suspected scribal influence is construed as weakness in Liszt's character and music, dismissed as inconsequential, or reluctantly acknowledged as a factor in Liszt's transformation from pianist to symphonist. I propose a more balanced view based on previously uninvestigated manuscript sources for incidental music to Herder's *Der entfesselte Prometheus*, produced in 1850.

Raff's full scores for an overture and eight choruses, prepared from Liszt's typically detailed short-score drafts, offer unrivaled opportunities to assess scribal influence. An original typology sorts contributions into four categories: minor tasks any competent musician could perform; transcribing unmarked passages in score order; extra doublings; and genuinely autonomous work, including the occasional invention of primary motives. Some of Raff's independent choices reflect astute awareness of Herder's text; others merely betray fascination with orchestral technique.

Liszt's revisions eliminated or varied the overwhelming majority of scribal accretions, although Raff deserves credit for several salient features of the choruses. In the overture, however, rejection of Raff's contributions is virtually complete. The revisions also disclose that Liszt adopted more transparent textures, articulated phrases through gradual increases in orchestral density, and exploited instrumental ranges more idiomatically.

## PUBLISHING PARAPHRASES AND CREATING COLLECTORS:

FRIEDRICH HOFMEISTER, FRANZ LISZT,  
AND THE TECHNOLOGY OF POPULARITY

James Deaville  
McMaster University

The newly accessible archive of prominent Leipzig music publisher Friedrich Hofmeister provides a wealth of insight into the firm's activities on behalf of important composers from the early 19th century, including Chopin, Schumann, and Liszt. Above all, the publisher's business records (especially its previously unknown print-run statistics and balance sheets) reveal for the first time details about Hofmeister's important promotion of Liszt, which occurred through the popularizing technology of publishing. Comparison of Hofmeister's high print runs from the 1840s for Liszt's most "crowd-pleasing" creations (*Réminiscences de Lucia di Lammermoor* and *Grand galop chromatique*) with the comparatively low initial publication statistics for important works by other Hofmeister composers like Schumann and Chopin establishes how marketability (thus popularity), and not aesthetic considerations, drove the early dissemination of the music. Furthermore, the large print runs for Liszt can be seen to coincide in general with his own performances of those works during the virtuoso tours in Germany. As seen in the press, it was a symbiotic relationship between publisher and public:

Hofmeister's high levels of Liszt publication both fed and resulted from the prevailing "Lisztomania." Surprisingly, the new statistics show that the public was purchasing in great numbers just those pieces that were beyond its technical capabilities. As Walter Benjamin and others help us theorize, however, this was an issue of collecting and empowerment: owning one of Liszt's latest virtuoso hits was the result of desires both to possess an artifact inscribed with his transcendent power and to participate in the "Lisztomania" of the times.

*Saturday afternoon, 6 November*

**THE POWERS, POLITICS, AND EROTICS OF VOICE IN  
SONG AND SCHOLARSHIP**

**Carolyn Abbate, Princeton University, Chair**

**VICO'S SONGS: DETOURS AT THE ORIGINS OF  
(ETHNO)MUSICOLOGY**

Gary Tomlinson  
University of Pennsylvania

At least since Derrida's *Of Grammatology*, it has not been news to note that the early 18th century is a period of intense, even epochal speculation over the nature and history of language. Accounts of this speculation, however, usually overlook the large role song played in it. Indeed, this period marks a watershed in European conceptions of song and voice. On one side of the divide stand Renaissance constructions of the social, psychological, and magical powers of voice, on the other side starkly different and decisively modern views. These differences reflect shifts of broader European conceptions in three areas: conceptions of Europe's own social polity, of the historical evolution of its societies, and of the nature of non-European societies. More than this: the new views of song helped to define these shifts. Europe's past, present, and place in the larger world were all renegotiated in this period through, among other means, analyses of song and voice.

I will characterize the novel role of song in changing language theories of the period, with reference especially to Vico (and glancingly to Rousseau). Then, focusing on one of the three aspects above, European views of non-European societies, I will suggest how the new ideas shifted European approaches to the singing, language, and societies of others.

**AN ALCHEMY OF BLACK VOICING**

Ronald Radano  
University of Wisconsin, Madison

The emergence of the "black voice" represents one of the unacknowledged miracles of the post-revolutionary American moment. What had been routinely dismissed as bestial noise would by the 1780s assume a tangible presence within public discourse, suggesting a veritable alchemy of sonic invention. First taking rhetorical form—as a public challenge to the constitutionality of northern slavery—the black voice would assume a musical presence soon after, widely recognized in the conversion rituals of the southern and western camp-meetings. By the mid 19th century, this magical form would take various incarnations, shifting according to the generative exchanges that cast it discursively into being.

This paper will outline the historical formation of black vocal music during its seminal phase of invention, when the rhetoric of resistance to slavery transforms into the sublimity of religious singing. In these two critical phases (encompassing the period 1780–1860), black voices continually intersect with white, whether debating the constitutionality of enslavement or sounding the transformative power of the conversion ritual. As voices commingle, however, whites also seek out forms of resistance according to the dominant racialist ideologies taking shape at the time. The conceptions of "difference" ascribed to black speaking and singing proceed from familiarity and sameness. A consideration of this paradox will serve to suggest ways of reshaping our conception of black music history within a broad, socio-dis-

cursive frame, one that unsettles simple racial distinctions as it links music inextricably to the formation of American ideologies of race.

### EXOTICISM IN NINETEENTH-CENTURY OPERA: VERDI, CONVENTION, AND WOMEN'S LOWER VOICES

Naomi André  
University of Michigan

In Verdi's largest principal roles for women's lower voices (Azucena from *Il Trovatore*, the Princess Eboli from *Don Carlos*, and Amneris from *Aida*), the element of exoticism figures prominently. All three operas use the contrast between "exotic" and "Western" elements to shape the relationship between the two principal female characters. Culturally significant themes embedded in these characters' portrayals include Azucena's identity as a gypsy, the several meanings of the veil in Eboli's "Veil Song" and the complex depiction of Egypt and Ethiopia in *Aida*.

Though the subject of exoticism and orientalism in opera is rich and multi-faceted, this study moves towards gaining a deeper understanding of Verdi's three principal roles for women's lower voices and what they reveal about conventions surrounding character and vocal types. After briefly addressing a few critical "exotic" elements in each of the three women individually, a broader view of these aspects will be taken to examine the three characters collectively. It is in this composite picture that a progression emerges which comments directly on Verdi's depiction of his low-voiced female character across these three operas.

The issue of which female characters have access to power and how they are construed within the hierarchy of the opera is pertinent for these three operas, and the element of the exotic is a lens through which these discourses may be read. These low-voiced women challenge the traditional norms set by the high soprano and reveal a strength and dignity that presents a new type of female heroine in late-19th-century Italian opera.

### WHO HEARS HERE? BLACK MUSIC, CRITICAL VOICE, AND THE MUSICOLOGICAL SKIN TRADE

Guthrie P. Ramsey, Jr.  
University of Pennsylvania

In a recent essay published in the *Chronicle of Higher Education*, African-American literature scholar Nellie Y. McKay addressed "the problem" of identity politics in the professoriat's hiring practices and scholarship. McKay argues that as a result of historical neglect (and despite its recent appeal), the field of black literature is faced with several related dilemmas. These include "the insufficiency of the black PhD pipeline, the efforts to discourage white graduate students from exploring black literature, and untrained white scholars' undertaking of scholarship in black literature." The paucity of black scholars in musicology has not gone unnoticed. In recent years some politically committed scholars formed the AMS Committee on Cultural Diversity in order to attract potential scholars from all minority groups into the field. But musicology's diversity agenda is accompanied with problems, and perhaps the most crucial one is that its goals remain unconnected to a conspicuous scholarly agenda in our field. No matter how noble our desires to diversify, the project will remain a marginal one if it is not tied to the traditional modes of "real work" in our discipline.

With these issues in mind, I explore the potential (and much needed) role of the critical black voice in research on black musical traditions, with attention to work that has appeared in the last 25 years. In addition, I critique something I call “the invisible, white critical I” with the goal of opening up a space for further interrogation of critical voices in the field. I argue for the acknowledgment of different perspectives and productive biases in black music research and in the discipline at large.

### LATE NINETEENTH-CENTURY SYMPHONY

**Bryan Gilliam, Duke University, Chair**

### A NEW SOURCE FOR THE “NEW WORLD” SYMPHONY

Michael Beckerman

University of California, Santa Barbara

It is well known that Dvořák’s “New World” Symphony was an attempt to show American composers how they might create national music. In interviews, Dvořák claimed he used African-American songs for models as he composed the symphony. The problem has always been this: Dvořák arrived in the United States in September 1892 and started sketching the symphony in mid December. Just how much Americana could he have assimilated in that short time? Most Dvořák scholars think that it was the African-American singer, Harry Burleigh, who provided Dvořák with what the composer took to be authentic American music, but it has never been possible to determine just when their first contact took place.

This study presents another, more verifiable source, which is completely unknown in the Dvořák literature. The memoirs of Dvořák’s secretary tell us that the critic James Huneker brought the composer a journal clipping with some musical examples, suggesting that they might be used as the basis for a symphonic work. This study establishes that the article in question was “Negro Music,” published in the Chicago journal, *Music*, in December of 1892, and that it was the primary stimulus for the symphony’s composition. Not only do melodies in the article resemble sketches for the symphony, but the article calls for a “Messiah of American music” to create national music based on such tunes. This study concludes with a look at a newly discovered copy of the article with marginalia found in the Dvořák Archive.

### BRUCKNER AND THE SUBLIME

(AN ESSAY ON CULTURAL POLITICS AND MUSICAL AESTHETICS)

Benjamin M. Korstvedt

University of St. Thomas

In the 1880s and 1890s Anton Bruckner’s symphonies provoked withering criticism from much of the Viennese Liberal establishment. A group of critics headed by Eduard Hanslick and Max Kalbeck decried Bruckner’s music not merely as flawed and illogical, but as “diseased and pernicious” (Hanslick) and even as an expression of “high treason” (Gustav Dömpke). This paper analyzes the musical and cultural logic of these peculiarly intense negative reactions by situating them and Bruckner’s music within the discourse about the aesthetic category of the sublime.

This analysis has three components. First, it offers a concise sketch of the idea of the sublime as it figured in 19th-century aesthetics. Beginning with Kant, the sublime was in-

creasingly understood as a revelatory mental state emerging out of the confrontation with aesthetic phenomena “too vast and significant, too strange and wonderful, to be easily assimilated” (Michaelis).

Second, this paper demonstrates, by means of a close analysis of salient passages, how the Adagio of Bruckner’s Eighth Symphony stages itself as sublime by dramatizing harmonic progressions that seem designed to astonish the ear, push it past its normal domain, and ultimately set in motion the process of sublime crisis and sudden revelation.

finally, the paper argues that negative critical responses to Bruckner’s symphonies, which tended to focus with remarkable acuity on exactly those musical traits that articulate sublimity, often encoded a fear that the sublime contested the sovereignty of worldly rationality and thus implicitly critiqued a value that was central to the ideology of Viennese Liberalism.

### “TRUTH AND POETRY IN MUSIC”: AUTOBIOGRAPHY IN THE FUNERAL MARCH OF MAHLER’S FIRST SYMPHONY

Francesca Draughon  
University of California, Los Angeles

Mahler claimed that his First and Second Symphonies “treat exhaustively my entire life; it is experience and suffering that I have written down with my lifeblood...truth and poetry in music.” The First Symphony, however, is seldom read as autobiography, partly because of conflicting indicators, such as the overall title “Titan” and the description of the funeral march as being “in the manner of Callot.” Yet the key to understanding the funeral march is autobiographical, hinging on Mahler’s self-identification as a cultural outsider, as someone “thrice homeless—as a native of Bohemia in Austria, as an Austrian amongst Germans, as a Jew throughout the world. Always an intruder, never welcomed.”

I will examine the intruding wind solos of the funeral march—uncritically labeled “Hungarian”—and establish through modal analysis that these solos are not Hungarian but rather Ukrainian Jewish musics reminiscent of klezmer bands. This new understanding allows for a more satisfactory examination of the main musical dialogue of the movement—the dialogue between the klezmer music, with its implicit Jewish identity, and the “Brüder Martin” canon, with its implicit Catholic identity—as an intricate critique of anti-Semitic Catholic Vienna. Just as Callot creates a fantasy of the oppressed forest animals carrying their hunter’s body to the grave in *The Hunter’s Funeral Procession*, which ostensibly inspired Mahler’s composition of this movement, so too does Mahler create, through what Mikhail Bakhtin has termed “carnavalesque” inversions of power, a fantasy of victory for the oppressed over the forces of cultural dominance.

### NIETZSCHE’S CONCEPT OF “EARTH” AND THE FINAL TWO SYMPHONIES OF RICHARD STRAUSS

Charles Youmans  
Pennsylvania State University

Given Strauss's compositional mastery during the early years of the 20th century—the period of *Salome* (1905), *Elektra* (1908), and *Der Rosenkavalier* (1910)—the existence of such aesthetically dubious works as the *Symphonia domestica* (1903) and *Eine Alpensinfonie* (1915) is difficult to explain. In particular, the composer's elevation of *Tonmalerei* to a structural principle suggests a desire to trivialize his symphonic output and to marginalize it in relation to his oeuvre as a whole. Pictorial inclinations repeatedly hindered the professional rise of the ostensibly “careerist” Strauss (beginning in 1888, when Cosima Wagner's criticism of excessive *Intelligenz* in *Don Juan* shook a productive friendship), but their increasing domination of his orchestral writing is as undeniable as the musical absurdity of their culmination in these “symphonies.”

The intellectual basis of this intensifying reliance on tone-painting lay in Nietzsche's concept of “earth,” an “optimistic” anti-metaphysical notion the composer encountered while working on *Also sprach Zarathustra* (and which he found anticipated in the *Erdegeist* of Goethe's *Faust*). Fundamentally, the idea involved an embrace of the physical, the *Diesselts*, grounding a personal form of *Anbetung* that focused not on the supernatural but on nature, work, and family. The appropriate musical idiom in which to enact this view was one emphatically purged of metaphysical associations—that is, a language that highlighted just those elements that had disturbed Cosima in 1888. Strauss's 20th-century symphonies attempt with studied philosophical intent to drive that 19th-century genre into the ground, in their treatment of form, their use of painterly detail, their handling of time, and their subject matter.

## WOMEN AND EARLY MUSIC

Robert Kendrick, University of Chicago, Chair

### VOX FEMININA: THE OFFICE OF ST. ISABEL FROM THE ABBEY OF LONGCHAMP

James Boyce  
Fordham University

The manuscript Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, latin 912 is a small 16th-century codex from the French Royal Abbey of Longchamp. According to an inscription on folio 1, it was owned by Sister Jehanne du Bost, a nun of Longchamp, who then gave it as a present to her friend, Sister Françoise Gilbert. With the exception of a prose in honor of St. Francis by Thomas of Celano, the entire manuscript is dedicated to the office of St. Isabel, sister of King Louis IX and foundress of Longchamp Abbey, where she died as a professed sister on 22 February 1269 at the age of 45.

Pope Julius II granted the privilege of venerating Isabel as a saint to the nuns of Longchamp in his bull of 19 January 1517, at which time he established the feast day as August 31st. This manuscript stems from this time, since one of the responsories specifically refers to Isabel as “mater nostra nunc sancta.” While the authorship of the office has been attributed to Robert Messier, confessor at Longchamp, this particular office may have been written by Sr. Jehanne or one of the other nuns of the Abbey.

The manuscript is fascinating for several reasons: it is a rare example of a medieval codex owned by a nun and given by her to another nun. It contains the only extant office with

music for St. Isabel and is the only surviving liturgical manuscript from Longchamp Abbey. As such it is a valuable tool for understanding how the nuns of Longchamp honored their foundress liturgically, since both the object of devotion and its practitioners were women.

This manuscript not only provides yet another hitherto unknown rhymed office with full text and music, but offers valuable insights into the liturgical practices and significant values of the nuns of Longchamp as they venerated their foundress and sister in religious life, St. Isabel.

*LE NONNE DELLA NINFA:*  
FEMININE VOICES AND MODAL RHETORIC IN THE  
GENERATIONS BEFORE MONTEVERDI

Laurie Stras  
University of Southampton

Of all the qualities that may be represented through the rhetorical manipulation of mode, gender is perhaps the most elusive; a woman's words are rarely heard in *Cinquecento* madrigals. When they are, their speaker is often the idealized Renaissance woman: subservient, unchallenging, and lacking rhetorical power. The most popular madrigal of the mid century, Domenico Ferabosco's "Io mi son giovinetta," presents such a portrait. Appropriately, the maiden's music is modally regular, for she has no skill in using rhetorical devices. Another of Ferabosco's madrigals—"Sta su, non mi far male," a dialogue depicting sexual violence—places male and female in stark opposition. Even in her agony and distress, the female voice cadences only on principal degrees. Conversely, the male voice does so only once, as he tries to placate his victim; elsewhere, his forceful (and manly) speech is adorned by "foreign" cadential pitches.

For Renaissance woman to be rhetorically empowered, she must necessarily assume characteristics beyond those considered naturally feminine; she that loses her femininity acquires a different voice. The betrayed protagonist of Marc'Antonio Ingegneri's "Bramo veder un di" loses her reason but gains masculine rhetoric, calling for spears to exact retribution on her faithless lover. Her music is modally unfettered; there is no real cadence on a principal degree until the end. It has been argued that Monteverdi, Ingegneri's pupil, used gender-specific harmonic organization in the proto-tonal repertoire. This paper will examine examples of gender representation in the pre-tonal repertoire that could have informed Monteverdi's harmonic characterizations.

*EL SON DE N'ALAMANDA:*  
ANOTHER MELODY BY A TROBAIRITZ?

Billee A. Bonse  
Ohio State University

It is well known that the trobairitz were quite active as authors of lyric poetry, but we are less certain of the extent to which they composed melodies for their verses. To date, only one melody has been widely accepted as the work of a trobairitz—that for “A chantar m'er” by the Comtessa de Dia. In this paper I explore the possibility of attributing one more melody to a trobairitz. The tune in question accompanies the *tenso* “S'ie-us qier cosseill, bell'ami'Alamanda,” a debate ostensibly composed between Giraut de Borneil and Alamanda, but transmitted in most manuscripts under Giraut's name alone. Many scholars have adopted this attribution and dismiss Alamanda as an invented trobairitz.

The evidence that has been cited in favor of Alamanda's authorship is a pair of *contrafacta* modeled after the *tenso*. In a *sirventes* by Bertran de Born and an exchange of *coblas*, or verses, between Bernart-Arnaut d'Armagnac and Lombarda, homage is paid to Alamanda, with Bertran actually identifying his borrowed tune as the “son de n'Alamanda.” Scholars have argued, however, that Bertran is identifying his borrowed tune by its textual incipit rather than by its composer.

Curiously, a further source of relevant testimony has heretofore been neglected by scholars. Both the *Doctrina de compondre dictats* and the *Lays d'Amors* include the *tenso* among those genres using borrowed melodies. Ultimately, then, just as with the two *contrafacta* mentioned above, the *tenso* traditionally attributed to Giraut was itself quite possibly based upon a borrowed melody, a *son* by Alamanda.

## HILDEGARD OF BINGEN AND THE FEAST OF ALL SAINTS: A NEW READING OF *SCIVIAS*

Margot Fassler  
Yale University

Hildegard of Bingen is unique among medieval composers for many reasons, chief among them the fact that she wrote a theological treatise, *Scivias*, which includes at its close both the texts for her first significant group of songs, and a truncated version of her musical drama, the *Ordo Virtutum*. The integration of theology, song, and drama was a deliberate and self-conscious feature of her first layer of writings.

As is known from the recently uncovered vita of her teacher, the nun Jutta, Hildegard became a Benedictine nun on the Feast of All Saints' day, November 1. Also within the last year, Hildegard scholars have recognized a noted antiphoner from the Disibodenberg in the manuscript catalogue of Hesbert. Thus for the first time, it is possible to reconstruct the liturgy Hildegard knew in the early decades of her life, including the feast of All Saints.

This paper argues that Hildegard used the Feast of All Saints as the framework for the design of *Scivias*, beginning with its opening, which refers strongly in its text, and in the illumination for the opening, to the Gospel of the day. Concentrating upon the final section of the treatise, that containing the songs and the play, I argue that the final vision is of an idealized All Saints' day, and that the interplay between song and drama and the use of musical models depend upon the ways in which each fits into the schema of this recreated festival.

**BACH, TELEMANN, AND PERFORMING FORCES**  
Joshua Rifkin, Cambridge, Massachusetts, Chair

THE AUTHENTICITY OF AND THEOLOGY BEHIND

BACH'S *KLEINES HARMONISCHES LABYRINTH*

Craig Wright  
Yale University

Ever since Philipp Spitta cast doubt on the authenticity of the *Kleines harmonisches Labyrinth*, this work has rested outside of or, at best, on the periphery of the Bach canon. Following Spitta's lead, the BGA, Günter Hausswald, and Peter Williams, among others, have suggested Johann David Heinichen as the composer. To be sure, this is a bizarre composition, one filled with tonal relationships that are shocking even by the progressive harmonic standards of J. S. Bach.

The present paper will attempt to show that this unique piece for organ is unquestionably by Bach. The eight extant manuscript sources either name Bach as the composer or are silent with regard to attribution. Mozart owned a copy of the work that, according to his probate, was ascribed to Bach. More important, the venerable tradition of the labyrinth in both Catholic and Protestant theology held that this symbol was a metaphor for the difficult, painful journey of life. Bach, like other composers of the time (e.g. Fischer, Marais, and Suppig) extended this metaphor, making the maze a symbol for the difficult tonal journey. Bach's harmonies may seem bizarre, but they are entirely concordant with the psychic state of terror traditionally associated with the labyrinth. Moreover, Bach's wanderings through a labyrinth of keys becomes more painful when the *Kleines harmonisches Labyrinth* is performed according to a system of unequal temperament. Where might Bach have experienced such a maze, and when in his career might he have written this work? Surely at Köthen, for here in the Prince's garden was an elaborate maze for which both visual and literary evidence remains.

PERFORMANCE PRACTICE OF THE ELECTORAL SAXON AND  
ROYAL POLISH *HOFKAPELLE*:  
EVIDENCE FROM THE PERFORMANCE MATERIALS OF  
*GESÙ AL CALVARIO*, JAN DISMAS ZELENKA, 1735

Janice B. Stockigt  
University of Melbourne

Examination of a set of parts which survives for Zelenka's "Componimento sacro" *Gesù al Calvario*—known to have been used by the Dresden *Hofkapelle* during the years when Italian-trained castrati were employed, when Johann Georg Pisendel led the orchestra, and when Johann Joachim Quantz was engaged as a flautist of the group—provides valuable information on the following aspects of the performance practice of one of the foremost German ensembles of the day:

- \* the size of the Dresden court chorus
- \* the size of the Dresden court orchestra
- \* ratios within the instrumental sections of the orchestra
- \* performance practices required of the vocalists and instrumentalists of the Dresden

*Hofkapelle*

- \* the significance of the Dresden copyists as intermediaries between composer and performer.

Throughout the 1720s, 30s, and 40s, performance conditions were changing in an extraordinarily interesting manner in Dresden. Although indications of the changes are evident in surviving scores, it is those materials used by instrumentalists and vocalists—the parts, with their markings and clarifications—that most accurately reflect the changes. Moreover, certain parts demonstrate the intervention of the Dresden court copyists, effectively adding a further layer of orchestration. Since most of the original performance materials used in Dresden during this era are now missing, those which survive for *Gesi al Calvario* represent an important and fascinating source for study.

“TELEMANN’S CHORUS”: VOCAL FORCES IN TELEMANN’S  
FRANKFURT CANTATAS AND THE IMPLICATIONS FOR THE  
“ONE ON A PART” CONTROVERSY

Jeanne Swack

University of Wisconsin, Madison

One of the most controversial issues in musicology in recent years has concerned the size of the performing forces in Bach’s vocal music. The idea that Bach’s vocal forces consisted of a single singer per part was initially put forth by Joshua Rifkin in 1981, but has remained controversial to the present time. In this paper, I will confirm, by means of internal evidence in the performing parts in the music of Bach’s most important contemporary, Georg Philipp Telemann, that the typical use of vocal parts was for each part to be used by a single singer, and that ripienists and concertists did not share parts. The parts copied for Telemann’s cantatas in Frankfurt are meticulously marked with regard to scoring. It is evident from an assessment of these parts that Telemann’s Frankfurt chorus generally consisted of only 4 singers: soprano, alto, tenor, and bass, except where carefully specified ripieno parts are included, most often only for the soprano in the thicker parts of the opening chorus and in the concluding chorale. The major exception to this is the cycle performed in 1716–17, the so-called “Italian Cycle,” in which Telemann often doubled all four parts with a single ripienist, for a total of eight singers.

BACH, TELEMANN, AND THE PROCESS OF  
TRANSFORMATIVE IMITATION IN BWV 1056/2 (156/1)

Steven Zohn

Temple University

Ian Payne

Charles Keene College, Leicester

A number of explanations have been advanced to explain the genesis of the well-known middle movement to Bach’s F-minor harpsichord concerto. The most recent—and most persuasive—of these is Joshua Rifkin’s theory that BWV 1056/2 belonged originally to a lost D-minor oboe concerto that survives in arranged form as the sinfonias to the Leipzig cantatas BWV 35 and 156. But while such source-critical studies have brought Bach’s reuse, revision, and recontextualization of the movement more sharply into focus, they have also left unanswered many important questions relating to Bach’s creative process.

This paper, greatly expanding upon the authors’ earlier observations (*The Musical Times*, December 1998), re-examines the origins of BWV 1056/2 from a new perspective, revealing

that it is substantially based upon a slow concerto movement by Telemann. Bach not only appropriated the opening measures of Telemann's movement nearly unaltered, but also adopted details of its scoring, harmony, phrase and cadential structure, and dimensions. Our examination of the movement's style and sources suggests that Bach encountered Telemann's concerto at Weimar or Köthen.

Beyond the issue of chronology, this discovery prompts a reconsideration of Bach's indebtedness to the music of other composers, for BWV 1056/2, unlike most works in which he "borrowed" or arranged material by others, is not readily construable as an act of expediency, stylistic research, or fulfillment of an external commission. In exploring the aesthetic context and motivations for Bach's borrowing, we demonstrate that his modeling process resonates deeply with the concept of transformative imitation as propounded by many 17th- and 18th-century musicians, writers, and artists.

### LISTENING TO MODERNISM

Arved Ashby, Ohio State University, Chair

#### "TONE-COLOR, MOVEMENT, CHANGING HARMONIC PLANES": COGNITIVE CONSTRAINTS AND MODERNISM IN THE MUSIC OF LIGETI

Amy Bauer

West Chester College

Modernist music, if not always loved, was yet tolerated because—as Rose Rosengard Subotnick reminds us—it seemed to have "kept alive the idea of individuality and thus the possibility of art." But just what it is that we do hear when we "listen to modernism" has only recently been addressed by cognitive research, research that would prove the apparent "unlistenability" of modern music.

Fred Lerdahl's recent work seems to question whether a music that matters is yet possible, given that effective listening strategies rely on the perception of hierarchy in musical structure, while effective compositional strategies locate musical significance in the literal detail of that structure. This fundamental tautology marks what Stanley Cavell calls the "burden of modernism": namely, the fact that the listener's incomprehension is ensured by the "procedures and problems it now seems necessary to composers to employ and confront to make a work of art at all." If we are to find a modernist music that matters, it will likely be a music "that doesn't chew up the past, that also doesn't signify the avant-garde past," as György Ligeti describes his work—a music that critiques modernism, and to some extent lies outside its precepts.

Ligeti's compositions obey none of Lerdahl's constraints; in the large orchestral work, *Lontano*, canons form a "kind of complex of tone-color, movement, changing harmonic planes" resistant to hierarchical structuring. This syntax of Ligeti's music works sounds of the past into new contexts, critiquing the idea of an essentialist, formalist music whose structure necessarily determines a particular mental representation. Rather than Lerdahl's hierarchically-structured listening grammar, Ligeti's music is best approached through a theory that allows for metaphorical and associative leaps, reflecting the nature of his music as a sophisti-

cated critique of modernism, and of the presumptions—both cognitive and historical—that would limit our musical perception.

TWENTIETH-CENTURY TONALITY, OR,  
BREAKING UP IS HARD TO DO

Lloyd Whitesell

State University of New York, Stony Brook

Multiple polemics have surrounded tonality in the 20th century, based on heated disagreement over the authenticity of tonal language in the modern world. Ideological positions have conditioned how music is heard, to the point where two listeners, reporting experience of a single work, seem to describe entirely different sonorous gestures. For example, some listeners hailed atonality as part of a liberating trend. Others heard it as reflecting “modernistic disintegration” (Thomas Mann), while differing over whether that was a desirable role for music. I would like to focus on the myths and metaphors which have organized our understanding of both tonal and post-tonal repertoires in this century. The cultural symbolism brought to bear on the “common language” of tonality—in some views, a repressed, shadow-image of modernism, a paradise lost—is extremely telling.

Material will be drawn from a spectrum of Anglo-American and German musical writing, representing composers, critics, and amateurs. The two chronological poles of discussion will be (1) the emergence of atonality and (2) the “rediscovery” of tonality in the generations of Rochberg and Reich. I will explore metaphors used to determine the value of tonality: nature, communication, expansion, disorder, and modern cataclysm (Cage’s description of the contemporary harmonic situation as a “bombed-out city”). My aim is historiographic. I want to give an idea of the diverse reception tonality has actually inspired, yet show how a certain myth of the collapse and death of tonality has remained influential in our pedagogical texts. The authenticity of tonality still figures in canon formation and the allocation of prestige.

THE MINIMAL OBJECT: THE EARLY MUSIC OF STEVE REICH

Christopher H. Gibbs

State University of New York, Buffalo

A phenomenological consideration of Steve Reich’s early compositions raises important questions about the status of these pieces as both musical objects and processes. This paper revisits issues explored in Patricia Carpenter’s widely discussed article “The Musical Object” (*Current Musicology* 5, 1967; with responses by Treitler, Cone, Arnheim, et al.). Using Varèse’s *Ionisation* and Cage’s early aleatory works as paradigmatic compositions, Carpenter considers the differences manifested in their formal structures (or diffusions), in the “distance” from which the audience apprehends them, and in the way the listening subject experiences time.

I argue that part of Reich’s remarkable achievement in a work such as *Clapping Music* (1972) is his dialectical synthesis of the qualities exemplified by the Varèse and Cage pieces. Reich creates a minimal object in which formal structures, often an arch-like symmetry, are definite, precise, and perceptible (as with Varèse), but in which the distance between the music and listener is broken down and temporal processes are closely explored (as with Cage). This tension between object and process in Reich’s music from the mid 1960s to mid ’70s is

also considered historically, specifically in relation to medieval polyphony. Finally, the paper speculates on some of the distinctive compositional and performative issues in Reich's music from this period that help to delineate differences between musical modernism and postmodernism.

STEVE REICH'S STRUCTURALIST FANTASIES:  
A PROGRAM FOR HEARING

Judy Lochhead

State University of New York, Stony Brook

Steve Reich's earliest explorations of musical minimalism in the late 1960s and '70s were accompanied by a rhetoric critical of, on one hand, the structural designs of integral serialism, and on the other hand, the pre-compositional processes of "experimental" music. Reich's critique of these two, then-dominant compositional approaches focused on whether the listener could be aware of—could hear in any meaningful sense—the compositional designs that the composers themselves were careful to articulate verbally. His own musical designs grew out of this critique, as exemplified in such works as *Violin Phase* (1967), *Drumming* (1971), and *Music for 18 Musicians* (1976).

While offering critique of serialist and experimental compositional practices, Reich's musical production replicates (rather than negates or transforms) the goals underlying the structuralist procedures of each type of prior compositional practice. This refiguring of structural goals extends to the role he assigns to the listener as perceiver of structural process. However, while Reich's overriding concern for the apprehension of structure conforms to the aesthetic of his predecessors, his particular and meticulous concern for the role the listener plays in the constitution of musical meaning is a harbinger of later, postmodernist strategies.

The paper contrasts a "modernist" with a "postmodernist" hearing, by comparing the listener figured in the three pieces listed above with the listener implied by, on one hand, Milton Babbitt's *Philomel* (1964) and John Cage's *Variations II* (1961) and, on the other, George Rochberg's *Music for the Magic Theater* (1965). The paper concludes with brief commentary on the resonances of Reich's concern for both the "object" (structure) and "subject" (listener) of music within the broader culture of the United States in the 1960s.

*Saturday evening, 6 November*

## STUDY SESSION

### (INTERNATIONAL HISPANIC MUSIC STUDY GROUP): THE INTERACTION OF TRADITIONAL AND ART MUSICS IN THE HISPANIC WORLD

**Leonora Saavedra, University of Pittsburgh, Chair**

**Bernardo Illari, University of Chicago**

**Ricardo Lorenz, University of Chicago**

**Cristina Magaldi, Towson State University**

**Álvaro Torrente, Royal Holloway College, University of London**

**Luisa Vilar, Universidad de las Américas, Puebla**

**Malena Kuss, University of North Texas, Session Respondent**

Historically, the Hispanic world has been a site of encounter between clashing cultures and social groups. Accordingly, its musical life has always been marked by a high degree of diversity, richness, and cross-fertilization. Our understanding of Hispanic music as a whole thus depends crucially upon an exploration of interactions between art music and traditional and popular musics. Participants in this session will offer a range of new perspectives on this critical matter, reflecting recent developments in the fields of cultural theory, musicology, ethnomusicology and post-colonial theory. Evidence of cross-fertilizations in specific musical practices and musical artifacts will be considered. In addition, each participant will engage in a critique of the methodologies that have been applied in earlier studies of these interactions.

Discussion will embrace several subsidiary threads as well, including the precise nature of the interaction and the usefulness of concepts such as hybridization, cross-fertilization, and appropriation; a critique of the covert values that lie behind the categorization of musics into traditional, popular, and art; issues of identity, ethnicity, and class evident both in the musics and in the discursive practices that surround them; and the circulation of hybridized musics as cultural goods.

Within these general parameters, session participants will bring to the table a wide range of relevant issues. These include: (1) the universalist versus nationalist dichotomy by which Latin American composers have addressed the great internal social-ethnic divide in the continent, while remaining strongly affiliated with the European modernist mainstream (Lorenz); (2) the relation seen in the works of today's youngest generation of Latin American composers between popular and folk music, local social struggle, and cosmopolitan aesthetic changes (Lorenz); (3) the oralization in the New World of the Spanish *tonos humanos* (Illari); (4) the limitations of both musicological and ethnomusicological approaches to the study of music production in the newly formed cities of 19th-century Latin America (Magaldi); (5) the historiographical myth of Spanish music in the early modern period as the quintessence of national religiosity and mysticism (Torrente); and (6) challenges to traditional historiographical approaches to the music and identity of nationalist Mexican composer Silvestre Revueltas (Vilar).

*Sunday morning, 7 November*

**TWENTIETH-CENTURY VOCAL MUSIC**

**Reinhold Brinkmann, Harvard University, Chair**

# ORATORIO OR SONG-CYCLE? EXPLORING THE CHRONOLOGY OF SCHOENBERG'S *GURRELIEDER*

Ulrich Krämer

Arnold Schoenberg Gesamtausgabe

Legend has it that Arnold Schoenberg conceived his *Gurrelieder* as a song-cycle with piano accompaniment comprised of only the first nine songs, before it evolved into his large-scale symphonic oratorio. Sources, however, do not support this legend. Schoenberg, on one of the earliest sketch-leaves, jotted down the head-motives of pieces that are not part of the first set of songs, thus leaving no doubt that he planned to include settings for the complete cycle of poems from the beginning. These pieces include the final song of the first part, "Lied der Waldtaube," the song which constitutes the second part, "Herrgott, weißt Du was Du tatest," and a piece from the third part of the oratorio, "Klaus Narr."

Based on these findings, the second part of my paper attempts to establish an approximate chronology of the compositional process. Evidence will be drawn from a variety of sources, including the original page numberings, the distribution of certain paper types, and a comparison of the two editions of the poems used by Schoenberg. I will argue that portions of the piece were rewritten in 1903 during the process of instrumentation. They include the beginning of "Lied des Bauern," a completely different version of which survived in sketch and full score, and sections of the second part, the original version of which used some of the material from "Klaus Narr" due to textual correspondences. Schoenberg was likely referring to these revisions when he stated that certain corrections had caused him more difficulties than the instrumentation itself.

## ORGANICIST ATHEISM: SCHOENBERG, *GURRELIEDER*, AND THE IMPLICATIONS OF JACOBSEN'S POETRY

Christopher A. Williams  
Bowling Green State University

Although the 1913 premiere of *Gurrelieder* was the occasion of Schoenberg's greatest public success, the work itself has conventionally been considered an epigonal relic of late Romanticism, marginal to understanding the composer's mature style or *fin-de-siècle* modernism in general. Since the years between the work's conception and its completion saw the composer's break with tonality, it stands outside the linear progress of Schoenberg's style. But this linear view misconstrues the significance of *Gurrelieder* for its own epoch and Schoenberg's development. Not mere post-Wagnerian throwback, it is rather a prime specimen of what Hermann Danuser has termed "Weltanschauungsmusik." Like many works of its era, *Gurrelieder* employs vast performance resources to set a cryptic eschatological text.

This paper re-examines the historical place of *Gurrelieder* in terms of a sharpened definition of its genre and a reassessment of the poet Jens Peter Jacobsen's relevance to Schoenberg's aesthetics. The worldview of *Gurrelieder* is focused on the power of nature to act as a life force in a godless universe. A biologist and translator of Darwin admired by German intellectuals of Schoenberg's generation, Jacobsen fashioned a brand of literary Naturalism that asserts atheism as the logical outcome of Darwinism. His writings oppose this atheistic view with intense sensual imagery of vegetative exfoliation, rendered with almost excessive biological

precision. For the music scholar, this language can suggest parallels with Schoenberg's motivic aesthetics.

Schoenberg scholarship has traditionally understated Jacobsen's significance relative to the poets Dehmel and George. But if *Gurrelieder* is "read" in light of Jacobsen's later works and their reception (especially the novel *Niels Lyhne*, which found its own musical reflection in Frederick Delius' late opera *Fennimore and Gerda*), it, too, can be seen as central to Schoenberg's aesthetic formation and as a significant early manifestation of modernism in its own right.

### THE ORIGINAL, UNPUBLISHED ENDING OF BARTÓK'S OPERA *DUKE BLUEBEARD'S CASTLE*

Carl S. Leafstedt

University of North Carolina, Greensboro

Almost a decade lapsed from the time *Duke Bluebeard's Castle*, Bartók's first and only opera, was composed until it appeared in print in 1921. Protracted existence only in manuscript state afforded Bartók several opportunities to critically re-evaluate his opera. That he took advantage of this situation, and revised his original thoughts in numerous instances, is confirmed by the state of the opera's surviving sources, which reveal extensive changes to several scenes, including the conclusion. A study of György Kroó (1981) first documented the existence of earlier versions of the opera's ending. New information drawn from contemporary Hungarian music journals and from materials at the Budapest Bartók Archive permits a more precise dating of Bartók's attempts to provide the opera with a satisfactory resolution. From this it emerges that three distinct versions of the ending were created from 1911 to 1917, all focusing on Bluebeard and Judith's last words to each other and the return of the opening F#-pentatonic theme to conclude the work. Scholars and biographers, following Kroó's lead, have not fully appreciated how different the later incarnations are from Bartók's original conception, transcribed here for the first time from autograph manuscripts. Once we recognize that parts of the published *Bluebeard's* score were not written in 1911, but instead in 1917, and that the entire opera benefited from comprehensive revision six years after it was first composed, it becomes easier to understand why *Bluebeard's Castle*, stylistically speaking, at times sounds like a work of the later war years.

### KATYA, BORIS, ROMEO, AND JULIETTE: LEOŠ JANÁČEK AND THE POETICS OF THE LOVE DUET

Derek Katz

University of California, Santa Barbara

Leoš Janáček provided his own libretti for all of his mature operas, assembling them in a seemingly haphazard manner from brief passages extracted from plays, prose works, and even cartoon captions. A central problem of Janáček scholarship has been to reconcile Janáček's powerful and dramatically compelling operas with his apparently capricious method of libretto construction. Janáček is generally credited with superb dramatic instincts, but he also possessed a highly detailed knowledge of operatic devices and traditions. This paper argues that Janáček was drawn to dramatic situations that are conventionally "operatic," and consciously and adroitly manipulated familiar musical gestures to elicit the appropriate emo-

tional responses from his audiences. Support for this argument comes from Janáček's personal library of scores, books, and programs, which are filled with glosses and annotations.

At the core of this study is a close reading of the love duet from the final scene of *Katya Kabanova*. Although the Janáček duet does not stylistically resemble the music of any other composer, this passage makes use of harmonic, melodic and orchestral tricks found in Gounod, Wagner, Verdi, Charpentier, and Puccini. Further examples drawn from an unpublished and discarded earlier setting of the libretto show that many of these devices were intentionally manipulated by Janáček.

## MUSIC IN SEVENTEENTH-CENTURY SPECTACLE AND COURT CULTURE

Harris S. Saunders, University of Illinois, Chicago, Chair

### PLAYING THE CANTATA

Roger Freitas

Eastman School of Music

The poetry of 17th-century Italian cantatas has often been criticized as predictable and artificial. I challenge this criticism by suggesting that in the social context of cantata performance, the playful permutation of conventional themes counted more than original personal expression.

Theodor Elwert long ago contended that *Seicento* love poetry "is not sentimental and subjective, but rather objective. . . . the baroque poet intends to bring a smile to [the reader's] lips, a smile owed to the exquisite pleasure that a clever thought or a successful witticism can excite." Indeed, Elwert's conception is reflected, among other places, in the aristocratic recreations of the age, descriptions of which tell of simple games designed to elicit witty verbal riffs (often poetic) on utterly conventional codes of love (Guazzo, Barbagli).

Laura Macy has suggested how polyphonic madrigals might have served as premeditated, musically-enhanced responses in these games. And much evidence indicates that cantatas too were understood in this playful manner: the genre was considered the successor to the madrigal in function (Crescimbeni); striking parallels appear between common games (laments, amorous stories, *questioni d'amore*) and categories of cantatas; and, more generally, aristocratic decorum demanded a mask of controlled suavity (Elias, Skrine). Further, this ludic attitude seems to have been shared by cantata composers, who sometimes contributed another layer of wit through surprising formal deviations. In the end, the constant afflictions of Clori and Fileno should perhaps not be taken (and portrayed) too earnestly, as these familiar characters vied with each other to suffer not most convincingly, but best.

## THE BAROQUE EQUESTRIAN BALLET: A REDISCOVERED EXAMPLE

BY BOLOGNESE COMPOSER G.P. COLONNA (1676)

Marc Vanscheeuwijck

University of Oregon

One of the last descendants of the medieval knightly tournament, the equestrian ballet was cultivated particularly in the 17th century at the ducal courts of northern Italy, in Paris, in Vienna, and in Munich. Performed outdoors on horseback, this stylized ballet form was usually preceded by a quasi-operatic allegorical introduction of which many librettos but very few scores have survived. Except for a few well-documented *tornei*, organized for major occasions such as royal weddings, almost no iconographic or archival material is available.

However, I recently discovered the complete autograph score of a *Torneo* — called *Le Stelle combattute dagli Elementi* and commissioned by Sigismondo Chigi from Bolognese composer G.P. Colonna for the Pepoli-Bentivoglio wedding in Ferrara (February 1676) — along with a full complement of documentation and correspondence about the preparation of the event. The combination of engravings, libretto, score (including music for the five *macchine*, each representing one of the contestants in the battle) and archival documentation represents a highly unique and complete body of information about this spectacle.

Results of my study of Colonna's *Torneo* (one of the last in its genre in Italy) will show how extremely well the composer has integrated his music — e.g. by using slow harmonic rhythm, simple strophic arias with ritornellos, etc. — into this particular type of outdoor spectacle. Finally, I will argue that the genre may have disappeared because the venue did not allow the use of new stylistic features typical of related genres such as oratorio and opera.

#### A VENETIAN “COURT”? POLITICS AND MUSIC AT PIAZZOLA

Irene Alm  
Rutgers University

The image of Venice is inextricably tied to her status as a republic. Her system of government set Venice apart from the courts of both Italy and Europe, and, indeed, was a factor in the emergence of commercial opera. Venice maintained a complex balance of power among her noble families through sumptuary laws and strict controls over private contact with foreign nobility. Opera, nonetheless, provided one means to circumvent these restrictions.

The most lavish Venetian operas were produced not in one of the city's many theaters, but at Piazzola sul Brenta, the villa where Procurator Marco Contarini (1631–1689) staged extravagant entertainments for a highly select audience. Numerous visitors published glowing reports of Piazzola. Moreover, a series of libretti with laudatory dedications and detailed engravings documented the opulent productions. Yet, only a single modern study—Camerini's *Piazzola* (1902)—exists, and it is essentially descriptive and often inaccurate.

During the 1680s—one of the most critical decades of the Turkish wars—Piazzola became the setting for the confluence of Venetian nobility and foreign dignitaries: in effect, a Venetian ‘court’ where theatrical splendor, political maneuverings, and military negotiations wove a web of intrigue, power, and display. This paper explores the dynamic mixture of politics, theater, and music—as well as Venetian and European nobility—at the villa. The spectacular entertainments of 1685 for Duke Ernst August of Brunswick serve as a focal point, setting in relief the musical and political significance of Piazzola.

#### HEROISM UNDONE IN THE EROTIC (MANUSCRIPT) PARODIES OF LULLY'S *TRAGÉDIES LYRIQUES*

Catherine E. Gordon-Seifert

## Providence College

During the second half of the 17th century in France, political erotica appeared in the form of manuscript parodies of Lully/Quinault operas. This paper shows how these parodies challenged the “language of heroism” promoted by Louis XIV, causing a breach in heroic myth-making meant to destroy noble images of masculinity. Parodies of operas, written by disaffected nobles and writers unrecognized by the patronage system, targeted the King and anyone associated with the royal body, and were part of a corpus of subversive literature that attempted to dismantle absolutism and images of heroism promoted by the King and realized in government-sanctioned works of art.

This study focuses on the multi-textual synthesis of original scenes, parody texts, dramatic function, and musical expression as multiples of parodic objectives. Parodied are some of the most serious moments in the *Tragédies*. Lycomède’s expression of victory about Alceste’s abduction (Scene 5, Act I, *Alceste*) becomes the macho musical utterance of a courtier who thinks he has successfully been cured of venereal disease. Scenes 6/7, Act III, *Bellerophon*, are parodied to portray a Marquis’ widow who must conjure up a “monstrous penis from Hell” to satisfy her sexual desires because men at court are impotent. Attacked as well are the King’s military exploits, his generals, and even Lully, a sodomite who loves little boys and accepts expensive gifts from rich men for sexual favors. Exposed are the private passions (and private parts) of the King and anyone in his favor. These parodies fed the public’s desire for details of royal intimacy, while also playing a part in the destruction of king/hero/man: perverting the very principles that structured and vivified the royal community.

**MUSIC MAKING AND NATION MAKING**  
**Philip V. Bohlman, University of Chicago, Chair**

THE NATION MADE SENSUOUS:  
 CHORAL SINGING IN TURN OF THE CENTURY BARCELONA  
 Catharine Macedo  
 Christ Church, Oxford University

As Barcelona’s turn of the century intellectuals sought to justify their long held suspicion that Madrid was hindering “progress,” many saw the social turmoil destabilizing Barcelona as evidence of an urgent need to differentiate Catalonia (the region of which Barcelona is the capital) from the effects of Madrid’s “ill-fated” imperialism. This “relative autonomy” was to be achieved by forging a “Catalan nation.” To this end, a broad range of cultural and scientific pursuits rapidly became understood as Catalanist activities, one of which was choral singing.

By examining the rhetorical strategies of Catalan-language sources, I shall aim to show how singing integrated the supra-collective of the nation into the supposed “personal identity” of the individual subject by encouraging song’s performance and reception to become affairs of heightened sensuous experience in which participants allegedly “awakened” themselves from the stupor induced by “Castilian oppression.” This process will be demonstrated by investigating how desire functioned as an inter-connector of the body singing, the body of song, and their surrounding environments.

The exploration of this phenomenon—which has not yet received interpretative musicological attention despite its central importance to Catalanism—complements Orientalist scholarship on the “Spanish exotic,” and also provides perspectives on why, in the hope of a better life, many thousands participated in, or loyally supported, the subjectification of the conceptually massive by means of the rising tide of Catalanist choral societies — why, in the words of a Madrid-based detractor, a “singing, political idea” became a nationalism of personalized experiences.

ARGENTINE CULTURAL CONSTRUCTION  
AND THE *GAUCHESCO* TRADITION

Deborah Schwartz-Kates  
University of Texas, San Antonio

In October 1957, Gilbert Chase pioneered the study of Latin American music with his article on Alberto Ginastera (1916–1983) in the *Musical Quarterly*. With this publication, Chase emerged as one of the earliest musicologists to analyze the work of an Argentine composer in a canonized North American journal. Just as significantly, he anticipated the integration of context and creation that characterizes current musicological discourse by connecting Ginastera’s compositions with the cultural, literary, and ideological movement known as the *gauchesco* tradition, which upholds the *gaucho* (the native horseman of the plains) as a symbol of the Argentine nation. Yet because Chase’s intention was to illuminate the aesthetic contribution of a single composer, he was unable to explore the fundamental position that this symbolic legacy held within the Argentine cultural heritage.

The present study extends the scope of Chase’s original investigation by proposing that the *gauchesco* tradition played an overarching role in shaping Argentine music and culture during the late 19th and early 20th centuries. The paper relies upon contemporary historical accounts and demographic evidence to suggest that national leaders constructed the *gaucho* symbol as a dominant emblem of Argentine identity in response to a perceived cultural crisis engendered by European immigration. Four generations of art music composers (ca.1890–1952) enhanced the potency of such symbolism by formulating musical codes derived from the *gaucho* heritage. Ginastera’s compositions constitute the final stage of such a development, and it is therefore against the background of earlier works referring to the *gauchesco* tradition that his nationally inspired music can most meaningfully be understood.

THE ALL-INDIA MUSIC CONFERENCES OF 1916–1925:  
THE REVISION OF THE NORTH INDIAN  
CLASSICAL MUSIC LANDSCAPE

David Trasoff  
California State University, San Marcos

Between 1916 and 1925, Vishnu Narayan Bhatkhande, a renowned Indian musicologist, organized a series of All-India music conferences with the express intent of modernizing North Indian or Hindustani classical music. These conferences were held in several major North Indian cultural centers, sponsored by the rulers of various “princely states” and the British colonial authorities. While Bhatkhande is best known today for his revision of a body of theory and repertoire collected from masters of Indian music over several decades, the All-India music conferences attempted to effect a public transformation of the existing social order of Hindustani classical music. This revision was reflected in the published speeches and remarks of the conference organizers. It can also be observed in the spatial and temporal organization of the conferences themselves, in the physical positioning and interaction of the participants. The “landscape” of the All-India music conferences can be viewed as a representation of Bhatkhande’s concept for the restructuring of North Indian classical music.

Proceedings of the four conferences have survived in archives in India and Britain. These wonderfully detailed accounts list the most minute particulars of expenses and contributions as well as the major policy statements of the festival organizers and their patrons, complete with lofty proposals and thinly disguised disappointments. Controversies among the disparate social groups brought together by the conferences over issues such as the utility of notation and the standardization of the canon were a significant factor in the recent development of this music tradition. A close scrutiny of the conference proceedings reveals the dynamics that underlay the social transformation of a music tradition over a critical decade, as the aristocratic music of the courts was changed into a “national” music.

## DEFINING AMERICAN IDENTITY: CULTURAL PRESERVATION, PRESENTATION, AND TRANSFORMATION

Ron Pen

University of Kentucky

“Give me your tired, your poor, your huddled masses yearning to breathe free” the Statue of Liberty invited, as foreigners poured into the United States at an annual rate of one million immigrants at the turn of the 20th century. This influx escalated tension between the “multiculturalism” of ethnic identity and the “melting pot” of assimilation, thereby raising questions of American identity that have yet to be resolved.

In this search for a national character, scholars and musicians “discovered” the traditional music of the Southern Appalachian region and subsequently issued collections such as Wyman and Brockway’s *Lonesome Tunes* (1916). These collections helped construct a myth of American identity by characterizing Appalachians as “our contemporary ancestors” and “true pioneer American stock descended from colonists who settled in the mountains long ago.” By extension, Appalachian musical expression was promulgated as the collective identity of the American people.

This paper is informed by a critical examination of 60 published folk collections (spanning 1905–1945) in terms of repertoire, performance format, and image representation, in order to discern the means by which cultural preservation and presentation transformed American national identity. Six key areas of collection and presentation ideology are addressed: (1) representation of Appalachian people as Elizabethan ancestors; (2) presentation of Appalachia as the essence of American culture; (3) description of the Appalachian Mountains as a geographic barrier insulating inhabitants from time and progress; (4) inculcation of

nativism, Anglo-Saxonism, and racism as reactions against immigration; (5) the collectors' heroic/descriptive narrative; and (6) the commodification of culture, as oral tradition was selectively transformed into written notation.

**THE LIVES OF MUSICAL THOUGHT: NATURE, IDEOLOGY, SUBJECTIVITY**

**Brian Hyer, University of Wisconsin, Madison, Chair**

**WAGNER RESEARCH AS *DIENST AM VOLKE*:**

**THE RICHARD-WAGNER-FORSCHUNGSSTÄTTE, 1938–1945**

Stephen McClatchie

University of Regina

On the 125th anniversary of Wagner's birth, 22 May 1938, Adolf Hitler proclaimed the foundation of a Richard-Wagner-Forschungsstätte in Bayreuth. The implementation of Hitler's order and the supervision of the RW-Forschungsstätte was entrusted to the head of the *Reichskanzlei*, Dr. H. H. Lammers; Pg. Dr. Otto Strobel, the Wagner family archivist since 1932, was named director. During its brief existence, the institute held a conference of Wagner scholars, collected and catalogued primary sources, and published a volume of *Neue Wagner-Forschungen*. Plans were drawn up for a critical collected edition of Wagner's writings and musical works, and work was done for a genealogical study entitled *Die Abstammung Richard Wagners: Legende und Wirklichkeit*.

The literature contains very little on the RW-Forschungsstätte. This preliminary survey is based on *Reichskanzlei* files in the *Bundesarchiv*, Koblenz (R43II/1230–1232). Amongst this material may be found annual reports of the activities of the institute from 1938–44, financial information, and extensive correspondence between Strobel, Lammers, and others. One particular thread revolves around the attempt, sponsored by Winifred Wagner, to have the Reichsführer-SS impose a ban on all writings about Wagner that did not stem from the RW-Forschungsstätte. This enterprise, along with the genealogical work mentioned above, is indicative of the tension between ideology and scholarship within the Forschungsstätte.

**REDEFINING THE “NATURAL”: EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY BACH  
CRITICISM AND THE IDEAL OF “UNITY IN DIVERSITY”**

Matthew Dirst

University of Houston

Examining various conceptions of the “natural” in 18th-century Bach criticism, this paper charts a little noticed change in an aesthetic category crucial to this era. In J.A. Scheibe's famous 1737 attack on Bach's “turgid” manner of writing, the “natural” refers to the straightforward and the tuneful (qualities Scheibe found lacking in Bach), while later critics looked beyond the surface of Bach's music—seeing motivic similarity more than intricate counterpoint, harmonic relatedness more than disjunction, the smooth progression of ideas more than highly rhetorical argument—and found therein evidence of his “natural” art. New ideas about the “natural” are plainly evident in an extraordinary 1782 essay by J. F. Reichardt, in which the author compares his previous experience of “certain pieces and passages” of both Bach and Handel with Goethe's famous pilgrimage to the Strasbourg Cathedral—both writers were stupefied by “a thousand harmonious details” which they could “by no means under-

stand or explain”—though later in the same essay Reichardt praises a Bach fugue for its “natural” expression. The observation that Bach’s was a strange and intricate art was hardly new, nor was the (seemingly contrary) assertion that his music could be “natural.” What was new in the last decades of the 18th century, however, was an effective way of explaining the peculiar combination of learnedness and beauty in Bach. The “natural” character of his music, according to a number of writers, was the result of its thoroughgoing yet intelligible exploration of simple material, its “unity in diversity.”

IRONY, SUBJECTIVITY, AND THE LIMITS OF THEORY  
IN GOTTFRIED WEBER’S ANALYSIS OF MOZART’S K. 465

Jairo Moreno  
Duke University

Weber’s 1832 analysis of the opening Adagio of Mozart’s “Dissonance” quartet is a classic exemplar of close reading. In over fifteen dense pages, Weber deploys his concept of *Mehrdeutigkeit* (“plural meaning”), giving nearly every pitch and chord multiple and often contradictory interpretations. “All that technical theory could have done, it has here done,” the analysis concludes. The suggestion is that even so flexible a concept as *Mehrdeutigkeit* cannot offer categorical explanation of the passage’s “harsh dissonances.” Nonetheless, Weber holds, the dissonances are valid, being sanctioned by the “ear of a Mozart.”

In this paper, I first place Weber’s concept of *Mehrdeutigkeit* and his recognition of the explanatory limits of “technical theory” against the backdrop of a 19th-century trope, irony. By irony I mean the epistemological predisposition that acknowledges the self-reflexivity of linguistic characterizations of experience. This definition relates to the traditional linguistic sense of irony as the trope that sanctions plural, simultaneous descriptions of reality. Second, I examine the narrative of Weber’s analysis, identifying in his acknowledgment of Mozart’s ultimate authority a particular emplotment strategy that corresponds to the literary archetype of satire. I consider satire (after Frye and White) as a comical drama controlled by the apprehension of our captivity in the world and by the realization that human consciousness is inadequately equipped to articulate the ineffable.

Weber’s note-by-note analysis reflects the way in which music stages its immediacy and acts as a trace of human consciousness. By recognizing the limits of theory he also implies that music, which refuses to be tied down to a terminal account of itself, has the capability to challenge and threaten the subject’s sense of self. As a historical document, Weber’s analysis marks an important moment in the history of analytical practice: analysis becomes process, not product, and theory—as a modality of knowledge—itself becomes a field of possibilities rather than a prescription of certainties.

BETWEEN ART AND NATURE: MUSIC THEORY AND  
CONSERVATIVE RHETORIC

Nicholas Cook  
University of Southampton

It is now generally recognized that claims of music’s autonomy, of its freedom from ideology, are themselves ideological: they replicate the rhetoric of conservative politicians who claim that their political views represent the natural order of things. In this paper I

consider theorists' invocations of nature in this light, focusing on the contrast between Schenker's and Schoenberg's reception of Rameau's harmonic theory. Each simplified the theory, emphasizing that nature provides only a hint of what art has developed from it, and affirmed the existence of exception-free natural laws. But each turned the argument in a different direction. Schenker's identification of natural law and musical style reflects the rhetoric of nature in early-20th-century German conservatism, the political ramifications of which are seen most clearly in Hindemith's *Unterweisung im Tonsatz*, written at a time (1937) when Hindemith was seeking to win the approbation of the National Socialists. (Lerdahl's 1988 model of tonal pitch space stands in the same conservative tradition.) By contrast, Schoenberg's distinction between natural (but currently unknown) laws and the stylistic guidelines of music theory prefigures the explicit anti-naturalism of Cazden and Babbitt, according to which all musical laws are social constructions. Babbitt's formalism was part of a broader reaction against Nazi misappropriations of nature, but ironically, through his insistence on "scientifically" neutral language, embodied the same sleight-of-hand as the conservative ideologues' naturalistic rhetoric. Such complicity between music theory and contemporary cultural and political values has a clear bearing on current controversies concerning its epistemological status.

### OPERATIC DISCOVERIES

Jessica P. Waldoff, College of the Holy Cross, Chair

#### MOZART'S SCENA "MISERO! O SOGNO, O SON DESTO?" K. 431

John A. Rice  
Houston, Texas

Valentin Adamberger, the first Belmonte in *Die Entführung aus dem Serail*, inspired Mozart to write some of his greatest music for the tenor voice, including the aria "Aura che intorno spiri" and the recitative that precedes it, "Misero! o sogno, o son desto?" Several questions have revolved for a long time around this splendid scena. Who wrote the text? If it was not written for Mozart, what is its source? In the opening recitative a male protagonist, imprisoned and alone, calls out to a group of women: "Aprite, indegne, / questa porta infernale, / spietate, aprite." (Open, disgraceful women, this infernal door; pitiless women, open.) That women should be holding a man captive (by force rather than by love or magic) is, within the context of 18th-century operatic conventions, extremely odd. Who is this imprisoned man? And who are these women who ignore his plea? When and where did Adamberger perform the scena? If, as is generally supposed, he did so in a concert in December 1783, why did Mozart refer as a "rondeaux" to an aria that in many respects does not follow the conventions of the two-tempo rondò?

My discovery of part of the text of "Misero! o sogno" in Salieri's *Il mondo alla rovescia* (Vienna, 1795) led me to identify the author as Caterino Mazzola, who reworked Metastasio's *La clemenza di Tito* for Mozart in 1791. Mozart and Salieri took the text from *Lisola capricciosa*, a libretto performed with music by Giacomo Rust in Venice in 1780. That identification suggests answers to some of the other questions that surround Mozart's scena and raises new issues for discussion.

TWO UNKNOWN MOVEMENTS FOR VERDI'S  
*UN GIORNO DI REGNO*

Francesco Izzo  
New York University

An examination of the autograph score of Giuseppe Verdi's *Un giorno di regno* (1840), preserved in the archive of Casa Ricordi in Milan, has led to the discovery of two pieces which have never been discussed in the scant literature on this opera—the stretta of the Terzetto in Act I (No. 6) “Amanti siamo e giovani,” later replaced by “Noi siamo amanti e giovani,” and the cabaletta of Edoardo's Aria in Act II (No. 8) “Lasciate ch'io spero,” later replaced by “Deh lasciate a un'alma amante.” The original versions of these two movements are complete and fully orchestrated, and the changes shed new light on important musical and dramatic aspects of Verdi's compositional process at the outset of his career.

The main portion of this paper describes the physical layout of the autograph of *Un giorno di regno*, discusses the chronology of the composition, and addresses some of the possible reasons for the replacement of the two sections. While it is clear that all the materials contained in the score were composed before the premiere of the opera at La Scala in 1840, the identification of two main groups of paper types indicates that several sections were inserted in the score after most of the composition had been completed. The substitution of the stretta of No. 6 belongs to this late phase, whereas the new cabaletta of No. 8 was presumably added at a slightly earlier stage. A comparison between the different versions of No. 6 leads to the suggestion that the revision represents a significant shift away from the conventional comic style of the original version. The replacement of the original cabaletta of No. 8, the text of which is different in prosody and contents from the final version, is more problematic, and may have been due in part to the voice of Lorenzo Salvi, the tenor who created Edoardo.

The second part of the paper addresses the replacement of these two movements in the context of other revisions found in both the musical and the verbal texts of the autograph, raising issues concerning the state of comic opera as a genre in the early 1840s.

**WAGNER AND FRANCE**

**Margaret Miner, University of Illinois, Chicago, Chair**

THE “GREAT SCHISM” OF 1886: WAGNER AND THE INTERNAL  
POLITICS OF THE *SOCIÉTÉ NATIONALE*

Michael Strasser

University of Evansville

Founded in 1871 by Romain Bussine, Camille Saint-Saëns, and a small group of like-minded musicians, the Société Nationale de Musique was intended as a forum for the introduction of “serious” music by French composers. During the next 15 years, Bussine and Saint-Saëns directed the organization, and Saint-Saëns often used his prominence and eloquence to defend it against the slurs of conservative critics, who considered it to be nothing more than a nest of Wagnerians.

As is often noted in histories of 19th-century French music, both Bussine and Saint-Saëns resigned from their leadership positions in 1886, ostensibly over a dispute involving the scheduling of works by foreign composers on Société programs, and were replaced by pupils of César Franck. A closer look at the circumstances surrounding this upheaval reveals that the debate about foreign music actually masked a far more serious and growing division between two increasingly hostile factions. Although they shared an admiration for German music (including, with differing degrees of enthusiasm, that of Wagner), the “conservative” and “radical” wings of the Société split over the question of how French composers should respond to Wagner’s provocative example.

Based on correspondence, documentary evidence, and contemporary press accounts, this paper will offer a more complete picture of the events surrounding the “Great Schism” of 1886 than has heretofore been presented, provide further evidence of Wagner’s impact on French musical life, and shed new light on one of the most important issues facing French composers in the last decades of the 19th century.

VÉRITÉ AND FÉCONDITÉ: THE ZOLA-BRUNEAU COLLABORATIONS

Steven Huebner

McGill University

This paper examines the imbrication of politics, nationalism, and aesthetics in operas by the novelist Émile Zola and the composer Alfred Bruneau: *Messidor* (Opéra 1897), *L’Ouragan* (Opéra-Comique, 1901), and *L’Enfant Roi* (Opéra-Comique, 1905). Central to this imbrication is the position that these works occupied in the sphere of Richard Wagner’s influence on French culture at the turn of the century.

The political orientation of the Zola/Bruneau collaborations was concordant with the particular form that republican, nationalist ideology took in Zola’s later novels, with their optimistic celebration of *fécondité* (of both womb and soil) and *vérité* (Zola’s verbal icon during the Dreyfus affair). The first part of the paper shows the extent to which Zola and Bruneau refashioned some of the premises of the *Ring* and *Tristan and Isolde* to harmonize with this ideology. In the case of *L’Ouragan*, this even involved musical allusion to *Tristan* as a foil. In order to contextualize these strategies, the second part of the paper traces the hostile reaction of the Wagnerian and right-wing critic Louis de Fourcaud to the Zola/Bruneau collaborations, as well as Zola’s public responses to these writings. The debate between Zola and Fourcaud will be shown to have resulted from different perceptions about *vérité* as it related to the unfolding of the Wagnerian legacy in the French context. The paper analyzes

the politics implicit in both Fourcaud's description of "poetic truth" in opera and his attacks on Bruneau and Zola as mere purveyors of artifice unworthy of French national genius.

## *Index of Authors, Panelists, and Session Chairs*

- Abbate, Carolyn .....  
Ahlquist, Karen .....  
Alm, Irene .....  
André, Naomi .....  
Antokoletz, Elliott .....  
Ashby, Arved .....  
Aspden, Suzanne .....  
Attinello, Paul .....  
Baade, Christina L. ....  
Baade, Colleen .....  
Barnett, Gregory .....  
Bauer, Amy .....  
Baur, Steven .....  
Beckerman, Michael ..... xx  
Bergeron, Katherine .....  
Bertagnolli, Paul A. ....  
Biancorosso, Giorgio .....  
Bick, Sally .....  
Blackburn, Bonnie J. ....  
Bohlman, Philip V. ....  
Bonse, Billee A. ....  
Boone, Graeme M. ....  
Bornstein, Andrea .....  
Boyce, James .....  
Boynton, Susan .....  
Brewer, Charles E. ....  
Brill, Mark .....  
Brinkmann, Reinhold .....  
Burr, Jessica .....  
Calico, Joy Haslam .....  
Carter, Marva G. ....  
Chapman, Dale .....  
Cook, Nicholas .....  
Cooley, Timothy .....  
Crist, Buckley Harris .....  
Cruz, Gabriela .....  
Cunningham, Valentine .....  
Cyrus, Cynthia .....  
de Jong, Nanette .....  
Deaville, James ..... xx  
DeVeaux, Scott .....  
Dirst, Matthew .....  
Doctor, Jenny .....  
Draughon, Francesca .....  
Fassler, Margot .....  
Feldman, Martha .....  
Fosler-Lussier, Danielle .....  
Freitas, Roger .....  
Frisch, Walter M. ....  
Fulcher, Jane F. ....  
Gasser, Nolan .....  
Gerbino, Giuseppe .....  
Gibbs, Christopher H. ....  
Giger, Andreas .....  
Gilliam, Bryan .....  
Goehr, Lydia .....  
Goldberg, Halina .....  
Goldmark, Daniel .....  
Gooley, Dana .....  
Gordon-Seifert, Catherine E. ....  
Gramit, David .....  
Graziano, John .....  
Grier, James .....  
Haar, James .....  
Haas, David .....  
Haggh, Barbara .....  
Hallman, Diana R. ....  
Hancock, Virginia .....  
Hansell, Kathleen K. ....  
Harley, Maria Anna .....  
Harris-Warrick, Rebecca .....  
Hinton, Stephen .....  
Hisama, Ellie M. ....  
Hoekner, Berthold .....  
Holford-Stevens, Leofranc .....  
Huebner, Steven .....  
Hyer, Brian .....  
Illari, Bernardo .....  
Izzo, Francesco .....  
Johnston, Gregory S. ....  
Judd, Cristle Collins .....  
Judd, Robert .....  
Kallberg, Jeffrey .....  
Karp, Theodore .....  
Katz, Derek .....  
Kauffman, Deborah .....  
Kelly, Thomas Forrest .....

- Kendrick, Robert .....  
 Kildea, Paul .....  
 Kmetz, John .....  
 Knittel, K. M. ....  
 Koegel, John .....  
 Korstvedt, Benjamin M. ....  
 Krämer, Ulrich .....  
 Kuss, Malena .....  
 Lambert, Sterling .....  
 Leafstedt, Carl S. ....  
 Ledbetter, Steven .....  
 Lochhead, Judy .....  
 Locke, Ralph P. ....  
 Lorenz, Ricardo .....  
 Macedo, Catharine .....  
 Macy, Laura .....  
 Magaldi, Cristina .....  
 Marissen, Michael .....  
 Marsh, Carol G. ....  
 Mazo, Margarita .....  
 McClary, Susan .....  
 McClatchie, Stephen .....  
 Miller, Bonny H. ....  
 Miner, Margaret .....  
 Mitchell, Donald .....  
 Moreno, Jairo .....  
 Mócziz, Klára .....  
 Mueller, Rena C. ....  
 Muir, Theresa .....  
 Murchison, Gayle .....  
 Murray, Russell .....  
 Muxfeldt, Kristina .....  
 Newcomb, Anthony .....  
 Newman, Nancy .....  
 Notley, Margaret .....  
 Nowacki, Edward C. ....  
 O'Connell, Jeremy Day .....  
 Oettinger, Rebecca Wagner .....  
 Owens, Jessie Ann .....  
 Parker, Roger .....  
 Pasler, Jann .....  
 Pen, Ron .....  
 Pollack, Janet .....  
 Poriss, Hilary .....  
 Potter, Pamela .....  
 Radano, Ronald .....  
 Ramsey, Guthrie P., Jr. ....  
 Reynolds, Christopher .....  
 Rice, John A. ....  
 Rice, Marc .....  
 Rifkin, Joshua .....  
 Rosenblatt, Jay .....  
 Saavedra, Leonora .....  
 Saunders, Harris S. ....  
 Saunders, Steven E. ....  
 Schwartz-Kates, Deborah .....  
 Seshadri, Anne L. ....  
 Smart, Mary Ann .....  
 Solinas, Rosa .....  
 Sposato, Jeffrey S. ....  
 Stockigt, Janice B. ....  
 Stras, Laurie .....  
 Strasser, Michael .....  
 Swack, Jeanne .....  
 Taricani, JoAnn .....  
 Tomlinson, Gary .....  
 Torrente, Álvaro .....  
 Trasoff, David .....  
 Usarek, Alicja I. ....  
 van Orden, Kate .....  
 Vanscheeuwijck, Marc .....  
 Vendrix, Philippe .....  
 Vilar, Luisa .....  
 Waldoff, Jessica P. ....  
 Warwick, Jacqueline .....  
 Weber, William .....  
 Weiss, Susan Forscher .....  
 Werb, Bret .....  
 Whitesell, Lloyd .....  
 Will, Richard .....  
 Williams, Christopher A. ....  
 Wilson, Christopher R. ....  
 Wistreich, Richard .....  
 Woideck, Carl .....  
 Wright, Craig .....  
 Youmans, Charles .....  
 Zakrzewska, Dorota .....  
 Zimmerman, Nadya .....  
 Zohn, Steven .....